

# Multitranslation within the Catalan and Valencian standards. *Harry Potter and the Philosopher's Stone* as a case in point<sup>1 2</sup>

Cristóbal Cabeza i Cáceres

Grup de recerca Transmedia Catalonia  
Universitat Autònoma de Barcelona

Adrián Gabriel Navarro Pérez (Translation)

## Abstract

First of all, a definition of multitranslation is given and a selective classification of the main multitranslated products in Catalan is offered. After that, multitranslation is contextualised within the sociology of translation. Then the polysystem of Catalan translation is analysed together with the linguistic, the political-economic and the cultural-communicative cosystems which influence multitranslation. Next, we present the multitranslation of *Harry Potter and the Philosopher's Stone* into Valencian and a comparative analysis of both the Catalan and the Valencian versions. Then, we review the reception of the Valencian version in the academic and literary fields. Finally, we define which are the relations among different cosystems regarding multitranslation and which were the translation policy and the textual-linguistic norms used for the multitranslation of our case study.

## Resum

En aquest article, en primer lloc definim la multitraduïció i fem una classificació selectiva dels principals productes multitraduïts en llengua catalana. Després de situar la multitraduïció com a objecte d'estudi de la sociologia de la traducció, analitzem el polisistema de la traducció en llengua catalana tot fent un repàs pels cosistemes lingüístic, políticoeconòmic i comunicativocultural, que determinen d'una o altra manera la multitraduïció. Seguidament, presentem el cas de la multitraduïció de *Harry Potter i la pedra filosofal* tot fent una anàlisi comparativa de les versions catalana i valenciana i analitzant la recepció que va tindre en l'àmbit acadèmic i literari. Per acabar, definim quines relacions s'estableixen en el fenomen de la multitraduïció en llengua catalana entre els diferents cosistemes i quina va ser la política de traducció i les normes lingüísticotextuals que es van seguir en fer la multitraduïció de l'estudi de cas.

## Keywords

Multitranslation. Polysystem. Translation Policy. Standard Language. Textual-linguistic Norms

## Paraules clau

Multitraduïció. Polisistema. Política de traducció. Llengua estàndard. Normes lingüístico-textuals

- 
1. This article is the English version of "La multitraduïció als estàndards català i valencià: el cas de *Harry Potter i la pedra filosofal*" by Cristóbal Cabeza i Cáceres. It was not published on the print version of *MonTI* for reasons of space. The online version of *MonTI* does not suffer from these limitations, and this is our way of promoting plurilingualism.
  2. This research has been funded by the Spanish Ministerio de Ciencia e Innovación FFI2009-08027, *La subtitulación para sordos y la audiodescripción: pruebas objetivas y planes de future*, by the Generalitat de Catalunya through 2009SGR700 and by the Universitat Autònoma de Barcelona.

In the last decade, there have been two controversies with certain media and social impact and which have made of multitranslation a subject for debate. First, the decision in 2001 to adapt and publish *Harry Potter and the Philosopher's Stone* into Valencian standard from the Catalan translation published in 1999. Second, the political-linguistic controversy in 2005 between the Valencian and the Catalan governments about which Catalan version of the treaty meant to establish a European Constitution had to be presented by the Spanish government to the European Union. These two cases, one of multitranslation and the second one with the intention of avoiding it, have been most notorious and created a social uproar at the time. In spite of this, multitranslation usually goes unnoticed, although it happens daily in many fields.

In this paper, we first define the concept of multitranslation and make a selective classification of the main multitranslated products (§1). Second, we place multitranslation as the object of study of the Sociology of Translation (§2) and analyse the polysystem of translation in Catalan language (§3) reviewing the different cosystems which determine multitranslation. Next, we present the case of the multitranslation of *Harry Potter and the Philosopher's Stone* (§4) by making a comparative analysis of the Catalan and the Valencian versions (§4.1) and analysing the reception it had in the literary and academic fields (§4.2). Finally, we show the conclusions of our research (§5).

## 1. Multitranslation and multitranslated products

By multitranslation we mean the phenomenon by which a product, originally in a source language, has several versions in a target language. These are characterized by being written in different standard modalities: either these are two direct translations from the source language or there has been an adaptation from the first translation into another standard modality.

This phenomenon is different to a translation done initially into Valencian standard (or Catalan standard). For instance, the translation by Vicent Alonso into Valencian standard of the three books of *Assaigs* by Montaigne, published by Proa in 2006, 2007 and 2008. We do not think that translations of the classic writers can be comparable to the phenomenon of multitranslation either: on most cases the translator plays a very important role and is who gives novelty to the product. Although there were already translations into Catalan standard of the *Divine Comedy* by Dante, the translation into Valencian standard by Joan Frances Mira (published by Proa in 2001) had its importance not for the standard used but for the translator: it was the *Divine Comedy* by Mira.

Multitranslation, in our opinion, is a transversal phenomenon that affects products from several fields translated simultaneously into both standards, Catalan and Valencian, or products first translated into one standard and later translated or adapted to the other standard for sociological, more than purely linguistic, reasons. We are going to present next a selective classification of multitranslated products in Catalan language to portray a map of multitranslation in our language and to show the extension of this phenomenon.

### 1.1. The publishing sector

Multitranslation, born precisely in the publishing sector, is a relatively recent practice in Catalan. The first big multitranslation in our language was the adaptation to the Balearic and Valencian standards of the Interconfessional Bible in Catalan (*Biblia Catalana Interconfessional*). The first one (*Biblia (traducció interconfessional): edició balear, Bisbats de*

*Mallorca, Menorca i Eivissa*) was published in 1994 by Claret publishers, and the second one (*Bíblia valenciana. Traducció interconfessional* (BVI)) in 1996 by the bishopric of Segorbe-Castelló and Saó publishers. At present, they are the only two versions of the Bible written in these two standard dialects. In the introduction of the BVI (1996: X) the “principles of translation” are commented: “the elaboration of this Bible has been constantly accompanied by the sensitivity and the effort to achieve ways of expression shared by the three big dialectal areas.” That means that in the Valencian version they used a convergent point of view with the rest of modalities of the linguistic territory. For this reason, the Valencian standard of this multitranslation uses the demonstratives *aquest* and *aqueix* (this/that) and the ending *-eix* for the inchoative verbs. All of these change in other multitranslated products.

An important group of multitranslated products in the publishing sector are school textbooks. Nowadays, the publishing groups which print these books in Catalan usually make multitranslations depending on the final consumer, if they are Valencian or Catalan. Valencian multitranslations follow the Valencian standard according to the normative of the Valencian Academy for the Language (AVL) (see 3.1.), i.e. they use the demonstratives *este* and *eixe* and the ending *-ix* for the inchoative verbs.

Another important group of products in this section are children's literature. It is normal practice for these products to adapt the linguistic model of the meta text to the standard variety nearest to the speaker: users at this stage are internalizing the written codification of their language and it is better if they feel a connection with it. This doesn't happen with young adults' literature, where users allegedly have internalized the written language and they are able to read other standard varieties. In section 4 we will analyse in detail the multitranslation of *Harry Potter and the Philosopher's Stone* to study this aspect more in depth.

## 1.2. Public administrations and the private sector

Multitranslation in public administrations basically occurs at the state level. The casuistry of the texts presented by the state to the citizens is varied: they are presented only in Spanish or, when they are also done in Catalan, there is either only one version (in Catalan standard) for the whole linguistic territory or a double version in Catalan standard (for Catalonia and Balearic Islands) and Valencian standard (for the Valencian Country).

We found multitranslations at the following websites: [last search: 30<sup>th</sup> June 2009]

Department of Public Works and Transport: <http://www.fomento.es>

Department for Culture: <http://www.mcu.es>

Department of Health and Social policies: <http://www.msc.es>

Tax Office: <http://www.aeat.es>

BOE (Spanish for Official Bulletin of the State) supplements : <http://www.boe.es/aeboe/>

Social Security: <http://www.seg-social.es>

Spanish Senate: <http://www.senado.es><sup>3</sup>

The rest of state administration websites<sup>4</sup> consulted only present one version in Catalan standard. It would be interesting to know which is the criteria used to determine when a site has to have either one or both versions.

Non-digital documents issued by the state (ID cards or administrative paperwork), TV advertising, campaigns or documentation from businesses which have or have had any kind of public management (for example *Telefónica*: Yellow Pages, the Phone Book or the voicemail service), are always presented as multitranslations by the state administration.

In the private sector there is only one case of multitranslation in *Mercadona's* website <http://www.mercadona.com> [last search: 30<sup>th</sup> June 2009]. A Valencian food stores company, it is the most important Spanish chain of supermarkets with an entirely Spanish capital. However,

3. As well as the website's multitranslation, it is interesting how, during the General Commission of the autonomous regions, the Catalan and Valencian delegate members have different interpreters (Branchadell, 2007).

4. CIS (Centre for Sociological Research), Ministry of Economy and Finance; Ministry of Territorial Policy; Foreign Office; Ministry of Justice; Home Office; Ministry of Labour and Immigration; Ministry of Industry, Tourism and Trade; Ministry of the Environment and Rural and Marine Affairs; Ministry of Housing Ministry of Science and Innovation and Ministry of Equality.

in 2007, *Eroski* group (<http://www.grupoeroski.es>) and the savings bank *Caja de Ahorros del Mediterráneo* (<http://www.cam.es>) had multitranslations in their websites. It seems multitranslations are decreasing in the private sector due, surely, to the extra cost it means.

The linguistic model of texts on both sectors, public and private, is according to the standards of both regional administrations, i.e. the government of Catalonia (*Generalitat de Catalunya*) and the government of the Valencian Country (*Generalitat Valenciana*), with the variants in vocabulary and verb morphology shown in section 3.1.: the use of the demonstratives *este* and *eixe* and the ending *-ix* for the inchoative verbs in the case of the *Generalitat Valenciana* as recommended by the AVL.

### 1.3. Media sector

In this sector we find all the dubbing and subtitling work done in *Televisió de Catalunya* (Catalonia), *Radiotelevisió Valenciana* (Valencia) and *IB3* (Balearic Islands). We refer to what is called external production, i.e. all those products that haven't been shot originally in Catalan and need a translation.

In the case of *Televisió de Catalunya*, its three channels (TV3, K3/CANAL33) broadcast all their programmes in Catalan and what it is not originally in Catalan it is dubbed. In the second case the main channel (Canal 9) broadcasts in Spanish and Valencian: cartoons are the only external product which is dubbed, while TV series and documentaries are broadcast in Spanish unless they are in-house productions (it happens on a high percentage); the other channel (Punt 2) broadcasts 100% in Valencian. In the last case, *IB3* only multitranslates cartoons; TV series and documentaries are not dubbed or they have the dubbing done by TV3, which is not a case of multitranslation. It is interesting mentioning a co-production by TV3, Canal 9 and TVG (Galician TV), *Omar Martínez*, which was filmed in Spanish and has dubbed versions in Catalan, Valencian and Galician.

Therefore, we can say that the bulk of multitranslations in the media sector consists mainly of cartoons, followed by documentaries, TV series and films. All of them follow the criteria seen in section 3.1.

## 2. Multitranslation as part of the Sociology of Translation

We have seen the diversity of multitranslated products that exist in Catalan. Now, we will contextualise theoretically the multitranslation phenomenon.

As explained before, we are interested in this phenomenon for the sociological reasons which motivate it. That is why we have based our theoretical basis on Translation Studies which, according to García González's terminology (2006: 125), can be included under the tag of Sociology of Linguistic Mediation, defined as:

the speciality of the linguistic mediation theory focused on the study of social factors which determine the translation and interpreting practice of different speakers' communities.

To do this, we will look at some theories and concepts that can be useful for the study of the factors which regulate the translation activity in the Catalan linguistic community and which help the phenomenon of multitranslation to occur.

### 2.1. The Manipulation School

As García González states (2006: 130), Holmes postulated (1977: 93-98) the need for considering the role of translation in society and the role of society in translation. Therefore, a new approach of research started in Translation Studies, thinking about the relations established between society and translation. As a result of this change in perspective claimed by Holmes, a new group of descriptive researchers study translated texts as products elaborated in a specific

social context (cf. García González 2006: 131). This new descriptive and systematic line of research (cf. Hurtado 2004: 558)

is called Manipulation School and represents, at the beginning, an approach to literary translation research. It has an emphasis on the manipulation produced in translations and on an orientation towards the target language and culture.

This school had theoreticians from different geographic origins. On one side there was the Tel-Aviv group, represented by Even-Zohar and Toury who postulated the Polysystem Theory; on the other side, the European and North American group, represented, among others, by Holmes, Hermans, Lambert, Lefevere and Bassnett, and known as Descriptive Translation Studies. As explained by García González (2006: 131), Hermans (1985: 10) presents these theoreticians as members of the same group but with different agendas which, later on, will be more noticeable and will lead to evolutions inside the group itself.

### 2.2.1. *The Polysystem Theory*

The conception of literature in the Polysystem Theory, formulated by the Israelite Even-Zohar, is (cf. Hurtado 2004: 562)

as a complex, dynamic and heterogeneous system made of many subsystems and where many different trends coexist on each phase of its evolution. The literary polysystem is connected to other systems of the framework of ideological and socio-economic structures within each society.

Following this characterization, the definition of polysystem would be (cf. Rabadán 1991: 294):

A group of dynamically interrelated semiotic co-systems regulated by historic norms. All human being's behaviouristic and social activities, including translation, form part of this group.

Although Even-Zohar initially conceived the Polysystem Theory for the study of the literary system, Hermans (1985: 11), as García González states (2006: 131), views it as a theory wide enough to stimulate the research on a wide variety of fields. This enables us to use this theory as a theoretical framework for the study of multitranslation.

If we analyse the polysystem of translation in Catalan, we can observe that it consists of a series of cosystems —linguistic, political-economic or cultural-communicative, for example— which affect the translation activity and play a very important role in the practice of multitranslation as we will see in section 3. The suitability of this theory lies in the fact that it makes possible to analyse all these cosystems and their influence on the whole polysystem of translation in Catalan. Also it helps to characterize a transversal phenomenon like multitranslation, which includes very different areas such as the media, the publishing, the administrative or the private sectors (see section 1).

### 2.2.2. *Descriptive Translation Studies*

The Manipulation School —and the Polysystem Theory as a part of it— evolve right from the beginning in the 70's. At the end of the 80's, theoreticians as Bassnet and Lefevere focused on the study of institutional and ideological factors which shape the translation, and Lambert focused on the mass media and the underlying political ideas (cf. Hurtado 2004: 559). These academicians introduce the concept of *patronage*, which Lefevere (1992: 15) defines as "the powers, (persons or institutions) which help hinder the writing, reading and rewriting of literature". This concept is very useful for our study because, as García González clarifies (2006: 145), is determined by three main elements:

- a) An ideological component, which means a need to maintain some control on the form and on the content of the source texts and on their translation.
- b) An economic component, which involves the analysis of the potential of a translation in relation to its economic benefits.
- c) A social component, which represents the writer [read also translator here] as a subject with a given status as a result of his/her position in the system. If the author [or translator] takes distance from the system, they take the risk of losing that status.

As for the concept of *ideology*, we are going to adopt the definition postulated by Van Dijk (2003: 14), as García González also explains (2006: 146): "the forms, conventions and fundamental beliefs, of a group and its members, which are interlaced and arrange our actions."

We will show in the conclusions how the agents who promote multitranslation act, based on these two concepts of *ideology* and *patronage* and a third concept from the Descriptive Translation Studies: the concept of *norm*.

### 2.2.3. Multitranslation norms

The concept of *norm* comes from the Sociology and the Social Psychology and Toury (1980) introduces it in Translation Studies. He defines it as "the formulation of general values or ideas which are shared by a community in a specific situation" (Hurtado 2004: 564). This definition, however, as Marzà explains (2006: 21), involves a serious problem when studying the norms that Toury himself detected: what we can observe through translated texts (textual sources) or the information provided by human agents and experts (extra-textual sources) are not "the norms themselves, but rather norm-governed instances of behaviour. To be even more precise, (...) , it is the products of such behaviour" (cf. Toury 1995: 65).

As a result of this, we can say that multitranslation is one of the activities we would include in the "norm-governed instances of behaviour". We are interested in knowing therefore, which are the norms that rule multitranslation. We will do that by analysing a specific case of multitranslation (see section 4). But before, we will look at the different types of norms, so we can choose the ones of most interest for our object of study.

Toury differentiates two big groups of norms: preliminary norms (aspects previous to the translation process) and operational norms (decisions taken during the translation process). In the first group of norms, we are interested in those referring to the translation policy, i.e. the group of factors governing the election of the textual types or the individual texts that have to be translated [multitranslated in our case] (cf. Toury 2004: 59). The fact that there exists a translation policy means that the texts and textual types are not chosen randomly and that it includes the decisions taken by every human or corporative agent who opt to do a multitranslation at any time. Thus, we can include here the governments and even other groups of power like publishers or private companies (cf. García González 2006: 137), as we have seen in section 1.

In the second group (operational norms), we are interested in the textual-linguistic ones. They affect the selection of the linguistic material of the target language. These norms will help us to make the analysis of our case study since, as stated by García González (2006: 140) "the translator's conduct is ruled by the decisions other authors have taken in similar situations or by the conditions the initiator [or patronage figure in the polysystemic terminology] suggests."

Here we have the linguistic factor. Although the translator is who makes the linguistic choices in a translation, the agents who order the translation have some well-defined criteria — even more noticeable perhaps in the case of multitranslation — which can determine those choices from a syntactic, morphological or even lexical point of view (see section 4.1.).

From the Manipulation School's theoretical point of view we can state that multitranslation is a phenomenon that forms part of the polysystem of translation and the cosystems underlying it, and that it is determined by the translation policy, by the textual-linguistic norms and by the patronage figure's ideology. In the following sections we will confirm this statement of

theoretical basis by analysing the polysystem of translation in Catalan and a case study of multitranslation.

### 3. The polysystem of translation in Catalan

As we have seen in section 2, the polysystem of translation has influences from other cosystems, parallel to it. They determine a series of factors which affect translation in general and, particularly, multitranslation. In this section we want to analyse the linguistic, the political-economic and the cultural-communicative cosystems, as we consider they have more effect in the multitranslation phenomenon. This analysis will help us to contextualise the case study (see section 4).

#### 3.1. *The linguistic cosystem*

In our opinion, the linguistic cosystem plays a very important role in multitranslation. If our language did not have a series of linguistic characteristics that allowed this phenomenon, multitranslation would not exist at all.

On the one hand, there are, at present, two legal normative entities in the Catalan-speaking territory: the *Institut d'Estudis Catalans* (IEC) and the *Acadèmia Valenciana de la Llengua* (AVL). This factor will be explained as part of the political-economic cosystem (section 3.2.3.), as we consider that the reasons for the creation of the AVL had a more political than a linguistic nature.

On the other hand, one of the differentiating characteristics of Catalan is the coexistence of several varieties that are considered standard. If we look for the classic definition of *standard modality*, we will find that it is a well-defined and codified linguistic variety, accepted by the whole linguistic community as the general norm and as a model of common reference. This common, general and supradialectal language has to, allegedly, enable and guarantee the widespread intercommunication of a linguistic community in the formal registers (cf. Bibiloni: 1997).

Yet, in our language, despite the high degree of internal cohesion, there is not one common, general and supradialectal standard but three. Each one is associated to one of the three main historic areas of the linguistic territory: Catalonia, the Valencian Country and the Balearic Islands. We will analyse next the variation elements that exist between them.

##### 3.1.1. *Variations in the normative language: Catalan, Valencian and Balearic standards*

It is interesting in our opinion to look at the aspects where the three main geographical standards of Catalan differ. This will be useful to analyse the case study and to know how many differences exist in the normative language.

It is important to stress the difference between standard and normative language. The concept of standard is associated to the language used in mass media and in formal registers while the concept of normative is related to the concepts of correctness or incorrectness of a specific linguistic form. To talk about the normative language, we have used the two normative texts that have legal validity in the Catalan-speaking territory nowadays: the *Gramàtica normativa valenciana* (AVL, 2006) and the *Gramàtica de la llengua catalana* (IEC, 2002). Needless to say, while the IEC text has collected the normative dialectal variation with a global perspective of the linguistic territory, the AVL text focuses on and prioritizes the Valencian particularities. For this reason, we are going to analyse the cases where two or more solutions can be considered normative and standard, depending on the variety used. Our analysis will be from the point of view of Spelling, Vocabulary and Morphosyntax. We will not look at orality as our study is about a literary product.

### 3.1.2 Spelling

The only graphic aspect where the IEC and the AVL normative grammars differ and, as a consequence, the Valencian standard from the Catalan and Balearic standards, is the acute accent of the vowel *e* in some specific cases; this agrees with the western phonetic realization in a series of words. The Valencian standard accepts the acute accent of *e* in the following cases:

- (a) Oxytone words ending in *-e*, *-en* or *-es*: *cinquè/cinqué*, *mossèn/mossén*, *espès/espés*, etc.
- (b) Infinitive forms ending in *-èixer*, *-èncer* and *-ènyer*: *conèixer/conéixer*, *convèncer/convéncer*, *atènyer/atényer*, etc.
- (c) 2<sup>nd</sup> and 3<sup>rd</sup> persons plural, imperfect indicative, with a written accent in their root: *fèiem/féiem*, *fèieu/féieu*, etc.
- (d) Paroxytones ending in *-ol*: *pèsol/pésol*, *tèrbol/térbol*, etc.
- (e) A few proparoxytones: *sèquia/séquia*, *sènia/sénia*, *sèpia/sépia*.

Nevertheless, as the *Gramàtica normativa valenciana* (cf. AVL 2006: 48) states, this acute accent of the *e* vowel is optional and:

Although usually pronounced with an acute *e* in Valencian, the grave accent is also used in two grammatical words of frequent use (the tonic relative and interrogative pronoun *què* and the conjunction *perquè*), some proparoxytone or paroxytone cultisms and neologisms that end in consonant (*èter*, *sèsam*, *plèiade*, *bèstia*, *sèrie* and *època*) and the toponym *València*, to avoid an excessive discrepancy between the different varieties of the language.

### 3.1.3 Vocabulary

The situation is different in this aspect because every normative dictionary of the linguistic territory shows the lexical variant. In the case of the IEC, the normative dictionary is the second edition of the *Diccionari de la llengua catalana*. In the case of the AVL, until the dictionary meant to be normative (*Diccionari valencià*) is completed, the contents of the computer program SALT 2.0 *Traductor i corrector de Valencià de la Generalitat Valenciana* have been declared official, except for the linguistic elements explicitly marked as vulgarisms, foreign words and colloquialisms, which will be object of study in the future (Normative Agreement 20<sup>th</sup> May 2002). For our classification of the vocabulary we have followed the first entry on both dictionaries.

Although, as users of the language, vocabulary appeals our interest, it is not a uniform aspect in multitranslation either, as we will see in section 4. We could also have included here the phraseology and lexical concurrences but we have not done it due to space reasons.

In this section there are two groups of words:

- (a) Same root words which have evolved differently according to the dialectal area: *ronyó/renyó*, *arrençar/arrancar*, *xiulet/xiulit*, *ametlla/ametla*, *cordill/cordell*, *xemeneia/ximenera*, etc.
- (b) Different root words: *sortir/eixir*, *mirall/espill*, *noi/al·lot/xic*, *cop/pic/volta*, *vermell/roig*, among others.

### 3.1.4 Morphosyntax

In this study we will focus on what we consider the main difference that stands out: the morphology of verbs. It presents more differences as there are some forms which can be called *incompatible* for the other standards:



	CATALAN	BALEARIC	VALENCIAN
1 <sup>st</sup> person singular and plural and 3 <sup>rd</sup> person plural, present indicative, 1 <sup>st</sup> conjugation	canto cantem canteu	cant cantam cantau	cante cantem canteu
1 <sup>st</sup> person singular inchoative verbs, and ending in <i>-eix</i>	pateixo -eix	patesc -eix	patisc -eix/-ix
1 <sup>st</sup> person singular, present indicative, 2 <sup>nd</sup> conjugation	temo	tem	tem
1 <sup>st</sup> and 2 <sup>nd</sup> persons plural and gerund forms of verbs ending in <i>-eure</i>	creiem creieu creient	creiem creieu creient	creiem/creem creieu/creeu creient/creent
Present subjunctive (1 <sup>st</sup> , 2 <sup>nd</sup> and 3 <sup>rd</sup> persons singular and 3 <sup>rd</sup> person plural) of every conjugation	canti cantis canti cantin	canti cantis canti cantin	cante cantes cante canten
Present subjunctive of inchoative verbs (1 <sup>st</sup> , 2 <sup>nd</sup> and 3 <sup>rd</sup> persons singular and 3 <sup>rd</sup> person plural)	pateixi pateixis pateixi pateixin	pateixi /-esqui pateixis/-esquis pateixi/-esqui pateixin/-esquin	patisca/-esca patisques/-esques patisca/-esca patisquen/-esquen
Imperfective subjunctive, 1 <sup>st</sup> conjugation	cantés cantassis cantés cantéssim cantéssiu cantessin	cantàs cantassis cantàs cantàssim cantàssiu cantassin	cantara/-às cantares/-asses cantara/-às cantàrem/-àssem cantàreu/-àsseu cantaren/-assen
Imperfect subjunctive, 2 <sup>nd</sup> conjugation	mengés mengassis mengés mengéssim mengéssiu mengessin	menjàs menjassis menjàs menjàssim menjàssiu menjassin	menjara/-às menjares/-asses menjara/-às menjàrem/-àssem menjàreu/-àsseu menjaren/-assen
Imperfect subjunctive, 3 <sup>rd</sup> conjugation	partís partissis partís partíssim partíssiu partissin	partís partissis partís partíssim partíssiu partissin	partira/-ís partires/-isses partira/-ís partírem/-ísseu partíreu/-ísseu partiren/-issen
Velar form of verbs in Valencian like in Old Catalan: <i>córrer</i> and <i>obrir</i>	jo corro jo obro jo corri jo obri	jo corr jo obr jo corri jo obri	jo córrec jo òbric jo còrrega jo òbriga

### 3.1.5. Other aspects

Apart from the differences we have just seen, there are few more aspects which are worth mentioning:

- The division of space in two (Catalan and Balearic) or in three (Valencian): *això/allò* opposite to *açò/això/allò*; *aquest/aquell* opposite to *aquest/aqueix/aquell* or *este/eixe/aquell*; and *aquí/allí* opposite to *ací/aquí/allí*.

- The combination of unstressed pronouns. The Valencian combination (nearer to the classical language) is *dóna-li'l*, *dóna-li-la*, *dóna-li-ho*, *dóna'ls-los*, *dóna'ls-les*, *dóna'ls-ho* while the Catalan combination is *dóna-l'hi*, *dóna-la-hi* and *dóna'ls-hi*. Besides, the pronoun *hi* has a more limited use in Valencian, i.e. the verb *haver-hi* only and, depending on the areas, other verbs such as *veure-s'hi*, *trobar-s'hi*, *jugar-s'hi* and *donar-s'hi igual*.

- The use of quantifiers to express the negative. In Valencian only *molt* and *massa* (*No m'agrada massa*) are used, while the rest of the linguistic territory would use preferably *gaire*. As for negative particles, it is worth noting the unfamiliarity in Valencian with *pas* (negation).

These are the main aspects where the two (or three) big standards differ, from a normative perspective. There could be a more exhaustive analysis taking into consideration the constructions, periphrasis, phraseology or lexical concurrences, but we haven't considered this important for the aim of our study.

There is another aspect which appears through the entire article. This is when we talk of a "Valencian standard" and a "Catalan standard", although these two could be referred as Western and Eastern standards according to theoreticians as Pradilla (2001) or Beltran (1986). This question needs some thought but the truth is that mainly only one standard based on the central dialect is taught in Catalonia, independently of the fact that wide areas such as Terres de l'Ebre (the southern region of Catalonia) or the region of Lleida could feel more identified with the Valencian (western) standard or, at least, could use its characteristics. However, the issue is not that simple and there are other factors which determine multitranslation.

### 3.2. *The political-economic cosystem*

Having analysed the linguistic cosystem factors that play a predominant role in multitranslation, we will do the same with the political-economic cosystem, i.e. determine which factors influence on the existence of multitranslations at the political, the legal and the economic levels.

#### 3.2.1 *The legal-political level*

In this section we will see some questions at the sociolinguistic level which is connected with the legal and political level and which will be explained at the right time.

For the analysis of the legal situation of Catalan in Spain we need to look into the 1978 Constitution. This is the common legal framework between all Catalan-speaking territories. Article no. 3 states that "Spanish is the official language of the State and that the other languages of Spain will be also official in their respective autonomous region, according to their statutes." If we pay attention, the only language mentioned is Spanish. The other languages are not mentioned or accounted, and it is the responsibility of the autonomous region to define or designate its own language and determine the level of co-officiality. This formula, according to Christine Bierbach (2002: 12) "can get to secure and legitimise the dialectalisation processes, or rather the dialectalising ideologies (...) to the detriment of the unity and normalization of languages such as Catalan."

This statement talks of "dialectalisation processes", i.e. processes which do not question the language unity but contribute to this dialectalisation. They affect the entire linguistic territory as they exist in Catalonia, the Valencian Country and the Balearic Islands. However, they are not always considered as dialectalisation processes or associated necessarily to the use of non-normative solutions. For instance, the use in Catalonia of infinitives without *-r* when followed by an unstressed pronoun (*planye's*, *coneixe's*) which is used in subtitling by TV of Catalonia (TVC) and in newspapers such as *El Periódico de Catalunya*; in the Valencian Country, the use of demonstratives *este* and *eixe*; or in the Balearic Islands the use of the "salat" article (*es*, *sa*).

#### 3.2.2. *The name of the language*

The debate around the name of the language is one of the aspects between the legal-political and the sociolinguistic levels mentioned previously. According to the 1978 Constitution, the autonomous regions where the ones to determine their own language. This has been one of the pitfalls that has made an element of political exploitation of the Catalan language, above all in the Valencian Country. The statute of autonomy of Valencia states in its first chapter, article 6 that: "1. The language of the Comunitat Valenciana is Valencian. 2. Valencian is the official language (...) as well as Spanish, which is the official language of the State." The only name to

designate the mother tongue spoken by Valencian people is "Valencian"; there is nowhere a mention to the name accepted by the international romance studies, "Catalan". This doesn't happen with the statute of the Balearic Islands, which does recognize Majorcan, Minorcan, Ibizan, etc. as constituents of the Catalan linguistic system. In the case of Valencian, the political manipulation of the language has been possible at certain times based on the official name of the language. An example of this is the no recognition, for the examinations (as civil servant) for the Government of Valencia, of the accreditation certificate of Catalan —issued by the administrations of Catalonia or the Balearic Islands— or even the degree in Catalan Language Studies as proof of the level of proficiency in Valencian. Therefore, there are many public or private companies and even the State (see section 1.2.) which multitranslate their documents depending on the public they are aiming at —Catalan or Valencian— and according to the respective statutes.

Regarding the use of a common name from a social perspective, Sanchis Guarner (1985: 22) claimed that

the reluctance of the Valencian people is to adopt for their language the name of Catalan, but not to accept the linguistic unity of Valencia, Catalonia and Majorca, which is evident and no Valencian person has ever denied it [apart from the secessionists during the last 40 years].

In fact, since the 13<sup>th</sup> century, the names given to the language in the Valencian Country are almost exclusively *valencià* (Valencian) and *llengua valenciana* (Valencian language), including "the constant and systematic use by the great writers of the Valencian Golden Age" (cf. Sanchis Guarner 1985: 35).

One of the most recent proposals to overcome the issue of the name, argues that, actually, the existence of two names has always characterized the Catalan language. Joan Solà, Ramon Lapiedra, Artur Quintana, Brauli Montoya, Abelard Saragossà (2004) and Jordi Colomina (2003) advocate for a nomenclature such as *valencià-català/valencianocatalà* —Valencian-Catalan— (it already happens in other languages in a dual-name situation) to "contribute to overcome old reluctances and barren confrontations and to avoid political parties subordinating the needs of the Valencian language and the Valencian society to their own interests."

### 3.2.3. *The normative institutions*

As seen previously, Catalan has, at present, two legal normative institutions: the Institut d'Estudis Catalans (IEC) and the Acadèmia Valenciana de la Llengua (AVL). The creation of this last one in 1998 was very criticized and discussed in the academic field throughout the whole linguistic territory. The reason for this was the doubtful nature of the interests attributed to the political party (PP) and the President (Eduardo Zaplana), both governing in the government of the Valencian Country at that time. Still, the government of Catalonia and the IEC gave a silent go-ahead and decided not to claim back the normative authority the Philological Section of the IEC had had until then.

There are questions that haven't yet achieved a consensus in the Catalan-Valencian philological community regarding the AVL. But we think that it is important to stress that, for the first time, there has been a recognition of the unity of the language in a Valencian constitutional law —avoiding, obviously, any reference to the term Catalan (Llei 7/1998):

the Valencian language, historic and mother tongue of the Comunitat Valenciana, is part of the linguistic system recognized as mother tongue by the corresponding Statutes of Autonomy of the Spanish territories of the Old Kingdom of Aragon.

On the other hand, the AVL is based on the established normativization and, consequently, all secessionist spelling norms have been legally neglected.

The AVL, and therefore, the government of the Valencian Country, although trying to converge with the rest of solutions adopted by the other Catalan-speaking territories, recommend "the genuine Valencian solutions", i.e. the use of the demonstratives *este* and *eixe*

or the ending *-ix* for the inchoative verbs. As we have seen in section 1.2., these solutions can be observed in the linguistic model of the regional government and in the multitranslations of administrative or private sector texts.

### 3.2.4. *The economic aspect*

Although this is one of the main aspects of the world we live in, there is a lack of ambitious numeric studies on the economy of the language. Still, it is important, from the theoretical point of view, the figure of Pau Rausell (2002: 127-154), a Valencian economist who has done a first approach to this subject. In his opinion, the economic factor has a certain relevance when a private company decides to offer its services in the mother tongue, i.e. if a company has its website or label in Catalan is, among other reasons, because they believe they will economically benefit from this; in the case of multitranslation, if a publishing house, for instance, decides to do a multitranslation of a product or a company wants to offer its website in Catalan and in Valencian, is because they think they will get an economic profit. The economic aspect, therefore, will be especially important when we refer to the private sector which doesn't have any legal obligation to do a multitranslation. The decision they take will be part of their translation policy.

### 3.3. *The cultural-communicative cosystem*

Translated products into the mother tongue, as accessible products, form part necessarily of the market of the linguistic community. There shouldn't be, allegedly, any problem to access all products in our language in a free market as the one we have (not just in Spain, but also throughout the whole linguistic territory). However, this does not happen, at least in the case of Catalonia and the Valencian Country. It is difficult to have access to the Valencian production in Catalonia and, likewise, the Catalan production in Valencia. This means that there are specific factors of our linguistic community which, undoubtedly, play a key role in the cultural-communicative products that, indirectly, affect multitranslation.

To study in depth this question we will review the Catalan Space of Communication Theory formulated by Josep Gifreu (from Gerona), as it includes the publishing and the media sectors. For Gifreu (2007) the Catalan space of communication is

a non-partidist —it has to be of interest for all political parties and involve them— and non-regionalist —it covers the whole linguistic territory— general strategy of action to enhance and vertebrate the Catalan cultural space.

The proposal of the Catalan space of communication takes specially into consideration two dimensions: an internal dimension, which aims at the intercommunication of all the historic territories of the Catalan language, and an external dimension, focused on the capacity of the Catalan cultural-linguistic community to achieve the external recognition as a differentiated space in equal conditions. To analyse multitranslation, we will focus on the internal dimension.

Gifreu (2007) analyses the present situation of the Catalan space of communication and emphasizes some strong points such as the amount of public broadcast radio and TV platforms that make think on the possibilities of production, influence and interchange between all areas of the linguistic territory, or the success achieved by some private business initiatives in the media sector, like the weekly *El Temps*, or the electronic newspaper *Vilaweb*. But he also underlines some weak points: the lack of a protected market of communication and cultural industries in Catalan; the progressive “Spanishation” of the big mass media contents and referents, distributed and consumed in the Catalan territories; or the absence of a profound commitment to the culture of the Catalan space from the Catalan cultural groups of power, who instead, have directed their ambitions to the Spanish market.

Gifreu (2007) also observes some black points which are of special interest for us: the fact that there is no radio or television channel who meets the needs of the inhabitants of the historic

territories of the Catalan language at the technical, the informative or the cultural levels; or the lack in the whole Catalan territory of consolidated private groups, in the media and culture sectors, with the capacity and will to compete in the internal and external markets. This helps us to understand, to a large extent, why the phenomenon of multitranslation exists in the publishing and media sectors.

#### 4. The case of *Harry Potter and the Philosopher's Stone*

In June 1997, the British publishing house Bloomsbury, published the novel for young adults *Harry Potter and the Philosopher's Stone*, by the Scottish writer Joanne Kathleen Rowling. The initial sales exceeded the expectations and the book won the most important British literary awards. A complete mass phenomenon, very soon it went outside the frontiers of UK. *Harry Potter* spread quickly to the other English-speaking countries and, 14 months after the publication in England, an adaptation in American English titled *Harry Potter and the Sorcerer's Stone* was released with the idea, of course, of achieving a better connection between the character and the North American reader. The first translations to romance languages didn't wait long: the publishing house Salani (Italy) released the Italian version in May 1998 —only 11 months after the original publication—; the French version was released (by Gallimard-Jeunesse) in October 1998; the Spanish version (by Salamandra) in January 1999, and the Portuguese (by Presença), the Romanian (by Egmont) and the Catalan (by Empúries) versions at the end of 1999. The Catalan publication, therefore, was released more or less at the same time than the two romance languages with less speakers and less economically strong (Portuguese and Romanian), although the situation of the linguistic normalization of these languages is very different to the situation of Catalan.

Harry Potter's Catalan adventure started here. The publishing house Empúries had bought the rights for the edition of the novel and asked Laura Escorihuela to do the translation. Once completed, Empúries distributed the first book of *Harry Potter* throughout the whole linguistic territory. The surprise was that they sold 73,000 books in Catalonia but only 1,200 in the Valencian territory (cf. Pinter: 2001). The commercial success was not the expected and, for this reason, Empúries decided to ask the Valencian writer Salvador Company, who had worked already for them, for an adaptation into Valencian standard (cf. Cabeza 2004:52). After being completed, Empúries also decided that the edition —and subsequent circulation and promotion— in the Valencian Country was to be done by Tàndem Edicions, a Valencian publishing house that was in the same distribution company as Empúries. The Valencian version was released at the same time as the first film, in November 2001. Next, we will show the changes made in the Valencian adaptation published by Tàndem Edicions.

##### 4.1. *Comparative analysis of the Catalan and Valencian versions*

We have read and compared the first chapter (twenty pages) of both versions simultaneously. To better see the differences between the translation and the adaptation we have divided this analysis in six blocks: lexical changes, morphosyntactic changes, morphological changes, improvement changes, possible changes that have not been made and other aspects. For each block we show some contextualised examples and some more examples with no context. The page number for each version is shown next to each example. At the end of each block, we discuss the options taken in the adaptation, bearing in mind what Salvador Company said in the interview we had with him in July 2004 (cf. Cabeza 2004: 50-61).

###### 4.1.1. *Lexical changes*

There are two types: a change for a word better known and an optional change.

## 4.1.1.1. Change for a word better known

CAT	"...perquè simplement no suportaven les ximpleries." (7)
VAL	"...simplement perquè no suportaven aquells <u>disbarats</u> ." (9)
CAT	"Era un home gros i fort que gairebé no tenia coll, però que lluïa un bigoti enorme." (7)
VAL	"Era un home gros i fort que <u>quasi</u> no tenia coll, però que lluïa un <u>bigot</u> enorme." (9)
CAT	"...espiant els veïns per sobre de les tanques." (7)
VAL	"...espiant els veïns per <u>damunt</u> de les tanques." (9)

CAT	ximple	nen petit	aixecar	aviat	dos quarts de nou	petó
VAL	babau	xiquet menut	alçar	prompte	huit i mitja	bes
CAT	en ple atac de rebequeria	sortia	copet	se li va acudir	trucades	una mica
VAL	en plena rabiola	eixia	colpet	se li ocorregué	telefonades	un poc
CAT	amoïnar	tarda	ensopegar	avui	casa seva	aquí
VAL	inquieta	vesprada	entropessar	hui	sa casa	ací
CAT	han estat	teva	..., ¿oi?	... ¿oi?	venir de gust	empassar
VAL	han sigut	teua	..., veritat?	..., no?	abellir	engolir
CAT	a tot plegat	sota	maó	neguitosa	gaire	cua d'ull
VAL	a tot allò	davall	rajola	desficiosa	molt	reüll
CAT	de debò	llimona	laminadura	força	vermell	busca
VAL	de veres	llima	llepolia	molt	roig	agulla
CAL	espatlles	cinc cops	cubell d'escombreries	s'hagués tret	anem per feina	enxamparan
VAT	muscles	cinc voltes	poal del fem	s'haguera llevat	ens afanyem	agafaran
CAL	marxem ens n'anem	màniga mànega	ampolles botelles			
VAT						

Some of these changes were not systematic in the multitranslation: sometimes *sobre* was changed for *damunt*, and *ensopegar* for *entropessar*, but not always. In this sense, Salvador Company said in the interview (cf. Cabeza 2001: 55) that he always maintained the same forms, but the proofreader and Rosa Serrano said that synonyms had to be used and, in his opinion, this was a teaching, pedagogic criteria, but not literary. This is a case of textual-linguistic norms (see section 2.2.3.).

## 4.1.1.2. Optional lexical changes

These lexical changes are not forced, i.e. the words of the original translation are also typical in Valencian.

CAT	"...no volien que el Dudley es fes amb un nen com aquell." (7)
VAL	"...no volien que el Dudley es <u>relacionara</u> amb un xiquet com aquell." (10)
CAT	"...i llançava els cereals a la paret." (8)
VAL	"...i <u>tirava</u> els cereals a la paret." (10)
CAT	"He vist com li clavava puntades de peu..." (18)
VAL	"He vist com li clavava <u>puntellades</u> ..." (22)

CAL	picar amb els dits	xàfec	Oh, i tant.	Són morts!	afer	a desgrat
VAT	tamborinar amb els dits	ruixats	Oh, ja ho crec.	Estan morts!	assumpte	de mala gana

#### 4.1.2. Morphosyntactic changes

There is a systematic change of order of *tampoc no* and *mai no*:

CAT	"Potter <u>tampoc no</u> era un cognom tan estrany..." (10)
VAL	"Potter <u>no</u> era <u>tampoc</u> un cognom tan estrany..." (12)
CAT	" <u>Mai no</u> l'havia vist" (10)
VAL	" <u>No</u> l'havia vist <u>mai</u> " (12)

The respective changes for weak pronouns are also made.

CAT	"Posats a pensar- <u>hi</u> , ni tan sols estava segur que..." (10)
VAL	"Posats a pensar- <u>ho</u> , ni tan sols estava segur que..." (12)
CAT	"No l' <u>hi</u> retreia..." (10)
VAL	"No li <u>ho</u> retreia..." (13)
CAT	"...com si l' <u>hi</u> haguessin trencat almenys dues vegades." (14)
VAL	"...com si <u>li</u> l'hagueren trencat almenys dues vegades." (17)

#### 4.1.3. Morphological changes

These changes correspond to section 3.1.4., i.e. verbal conjugation and possessive forms. They are systematic, so we will only show a few examples:

CAT	"...era que algú el <u>descobrí</u> ." (7)
VAL	"...era que algú el <u>descobrirá</u> ." (9)
CAT	"...perquè la seva germana i l' <u>inútil</u> del seu marit..." (7)
VAL	"...perquè la <u>seua</u> germana i l' <u>inútil</u> del seu marit..." (9)
CAT	"...els gats no llegeixen ni mapes ni cartells." (8)
VAL	"...els gats no <u>lligen</u> ni mapes ni cartells." (11)

#### 4.1.4. Improvement changes

These changes usually correct not very genuine expressions or mistakes made as a result of the influence of Spanish or English.

CAT	"Ningú d'ells no es va fixar en el gran mussol..." (8)
VAL	" <u>Cap</u> d'ells no es va fixar en el gran mussol..." (10)
CAT	"[a les aus] se les ha vist volar pertot arreu." (11)
VAL	"[a les aus] se les ha <u>vistes</u> volar per totes bandes." (14)
CAT	"Estava clar que, fos el que fos,...." (17)
VAL	" <u>Era evident</u> que, fóra el que fóra,...." (20)
CAT	"Però el Dumbledore estava buscant un altre pica-pica..." (17)
VAL	"Però Dumbledore <u>buscava</u> un altre pica-pica..." (20)
CAT	"...i planetes minúsculs que donaven voltes a l'esfera." (19)
VAL	"...i planetes minúsculs que <u>feien</u> voltes a l'esfera." (21)
CAT	"...per la cantonada de l'altre final del carrer." (21)
VAL	"...per la cantonada de l'altre <u>cap</u> del carrer." (25)

Regarding the role of Salvador Company in this case, he stated that, when in doubt or if there was something that did not seem right, he checked the original version (cf. Cabeza 2001: 54).

Therefore, the multitranslation was also a revision which helped to amend and improve the first translation.

#### 4.1.5. Possible changes that were not made

The examples shown here could have been theoretically adapted to a more normative Valencian form –included in brackets–, but it was decided not to do it.

"...per anar a la feina" (faena) (11)
"...i va fer marxa enrere..." (arrere) (11)
"El senyor Dursley es va quedar glaçat." (gelat) (10)
"...gairebé mai se les veu de dia..." (quasi) (14)
"Però, d'on has tret aquesta moto?" (esta) (23)

It is worth mentioning that the use and form of the demonstratives have not been changed, i.e. the division of the space in two (*aquest, aquell*) has been kept instead of changing it to the division in three (*aquest, aqueix, aquell*), or using the Valencian forms (*este, eixe*). Salvador Company claimed this was also a decision from Tàndem Edicions. Regarding words with a more normative form in Valencian than the ones kept in the adaptation, Company said that either he made a mistake and Tàndem Edicions did too, or that they all agreed to leave some words because Tàndem wanted some words from the Eastern Catalan to prevail and mix them (cf. Cabeza 2004: 51).

#### 4.1.6. Other aspects

The version by Empúries used the interrogation mark to open and close questions, but the version by Tàndem used it only to close questions.

Tàndem chose to keep the accents following the Catalan normative (*conèixer, serè, vostè*), instead of the Valencian normative (*conèixer, seré, vosté*) which is the normal practice in Valencian publishing houses.

The way professors address each other is with the form *vós* in the Catalan version but *vostè* in the Valencian version:

(1) "Quina sorpresa, veure-us aquí, professora McGonagall!" (14)

(2) "Quina sorpresa, veure-la ací, professora McGonagall!" (18)

There are also differences when using the informal register:

(1) "¿D'on has tret aquesta moto? -Me l'han deixat, professor..." (19)

(2) "D'on has tret aquesta moto? -Me l'han deixà, professor..." (23)

There is a change here in the way to show orality: in the Valencian multitranslation the uneducated nature of this character is identified with the oral language (*deixada*, drops the suffix *-ada* which leaves *deixà*). What we extract from the interview to Company is that the majority of the options shown in this section also had to do with the textual-linguistic norms that Tàndem gave him (cf. Cabeza 2004: 51-61).

## 4.2. The reception of the Catalan and the Valencian versions

The release of the Valencian edition of Harry Potter in 2001 —at the same time as the 1<sup>st</sup> Valencian Books Fair (I Saló Valencià del Llibre) and the releasing of the film— created a storm which had quite an important media repercussion. The first consequence was a greater circulation of the book in the Valencian young population: in December there was a second edition, and according to the information facilitated by Tàndem, 6,000 books were sold. The literary and publishing sector, though, had a lot to say, and the reactions appeared very soon.

If the book were for children under ten, it wouldn't seem strange that there was a Valencian adaptation, as it is the normal practice in the sector. However, Harry Potter is for a reader



between the ages of 11 and 15. This was the first time there was an adaptation to Valencian standard of a book for young adults. There was harsh criticism from the Valencian literary and publishing sectors: Josep Gregori, editor of the publishing house Bromera, claimed that this practice involved "a certain risk of linguistic fragmentation", and the writer Toni Cucarella stated that this adaptation meant "the first step to the Galicianisation of the Catalan language in the Valencian Country" (cf. Pinter: 2001). There were other people who, on the contrary, approved of this adaptation: Rosa Serrano, editor of Tàndem, stated that "if readers felt comfortable reading books like Harry Potter, they would transit later to other Catalan works with no problems, no matter the variant" (cf. Serrano: 2001), although she also admitted that the multitranslation created uncertainty in the publishing sector and that "many times the decisions taken as a company could be the wrong ones in the long term" (cf. Pinter: 2001).

There were also comments to the linguistic aspects of the original translation. Empúries editor, Bernat Puigtobella (2001) says that

maybe Laura Escorihuela, who has grasped the language of children with a good sense of humour, has made a version in Catalan that is very typical of Barcelona; or that the orality of the novel, full of idioms, plays (and traps) on words [and we would add delivery dates], has favoured the dialectal variety which is nearer to Empúries, by sheer demographic density.

Joan Solà (2001) criticises the language of the Catalan translation: he finds it "stiff and that it does not feel completely ours." Pere Martí i Bertran (2002) describes the language used as *catalanyol* (Catalanish) and shows his worries about this type of translation becoming part of the classics of the Catalan literature. Joan Frances Mira (2002) expresses, on the one hand, his discontent with the linguistic model of the Catalan version, and on the other hand, his wish that the education system would favour all Catalan-speaking young people to feel as their own the differences (vocabulary and morphology) that exist between the Catalan dialects; he approves of the linguistic model used in the Valencian version because of the lack of secessionist or dialectal will from Salvador Company.

Regarding the sociolinguistic aspects, Puigtobella (2001) considers that "we shouldn't forget about the explicit reluctance many Valencian parents and teachers have -not even mentioning the authorities- when they see a book in Catalan published in Barcelona." Francesc Esteve, Josep Ferrer, Lluís Marquet and Juli Moll (2001) raise more general questions such as if the Catalan regions are like a complete and normal cultural-linguistic community; if this adaptation, they wonder, has been done for linguistic reasons, taking as an example the case of Terres de l'Ebre (southern region of Catalonia) or the Balearic Islands, where the objective linguistic distance is more or less the same as that of the Valencian Country but where there wasn't any adaptation; they also criticise the government of Catalonia for translating laws into Catalan that had already been translated by the government of the Valencian Country, and the University Pompeu Fabra, for translating the Penal Code which had already been translated by the Valencian publishing house Tirant lo Blanch in collaboration with the *Institut Joan Lluís Vives*. This group of authors dot the i's and cross the t's when they argue that this problem affects all the linguistic community and not just one part. And in face of the conclusions of the article it is also revealing Josep Gregori's (Bromera's editor) statement that "to get to the Valencian readers it was necessary an action more commercial than linguistic" (cf. Pinter: 2001).

## 5. Conclusions

Multitranslation is a phenomenon which forms part of the polysystem of translation and the cosystems underlying it. It is determined by the translation policy, the textual-linguistic norms and the ideology of the patronage figure. In the case of Catalan, we have established a series of interlaced cosystems which affect simultaneously, but differently, the multitranslation phenomenon. The linguistic cosystem in itself, i.e. a language with various normative standards, makes this phenomenon possible. On the other hand, we can state that the political-economic cosystem is the one that most affects multitranslation in the administrative sector, as there is a normative institution for each standard (AVL and IEC) and because politically and legally the

language has two names: Catalan and Valencian. The economic benefit that private companies expect to obtain also affects multitranslation. Regarding the publishing and media sectors, the cultural-communicative cosystem has more weight in multitranslations. As the respective markets are divided by administrative frontiers, the difficulty to distribute translations in the mother tongue, irrespective of the standard used, increases.

In the specific case of *Harry Potter and the Philosopher's Stone*, we can claim that the decision to adapt the book to the Valencian standard starts in Catalonia, for mainly economic and distributional reasons. Economic, because Empúries thinks that adapting the text will give them a greater economic profit from the royalties. i.e. Empúries didn't actually have the infrastructure to distribute a book on such a big scale in the Valencian territory and, for this reason, they asked Tàndem to do it. It is evident why this text was multitranslated, i.e. which was Empúries multitranslation policy. Concerning the ideology and the textual-linguistic norms of the patronage figure (in this case Tàndem, responsible for the edition), these are also patently clear through the analysis of both versions and the interview to Salvador Company: to adapt the Catalan version to the Valencian standard, not following the AVL linguistic model, but keeping words typical of the Catalan standard, too.

## Bibliography

- (2007) *Constitució espanyola*. Barcelona: Parlament de Catalunya. Electronic version: <http://www.parlament.cat/activitat/constitucio.pdf> [Last visited: 30th June 2009]
- (2006) *Estatut d'Autonomia de la Comunitat Valenciana*. València: Corts Valencianes. Electronic version: [http://www.cortsvalecnianes.es/descarga/archivo/Estatut\\_dAutonomia.pdf](http://www.cortsvalecnianes.es/descarga/archivo/Estatut_dAutonomia.pdf) [Last visited: 30th June 2009]
- (1996) *Bíblia Valenciana. Traducció interconfessional*. Castelló de la Plana: Saó.
- ACADÈMIA VALENCIANA DE LA LLENGUA. (2006) *Gramàtica Normativa Valenciana*. (Textos Normatius, 2) València: Publicacions de l'Acadèmia Valenciana de la Llengua. Electronic version: <http://www.avl.gva.es/PDF/GNV.pdf> [Last visited: 30th June 2009]
- ACADÈMIA VALENCIANA DE LA LLENGUA. (2002) *Acord normatiu de 20 de maig de 2002*. València: Publicacions de l'Acadèmia Valenciana de la Llengua. Electronic version: <http://www.avl.gva.es/img/EdicionsPublicacions/AcordsGenerals/RESOLUCIO12.pdf> [Last visited: 30th June 2009]
- BELTRAN, Joan. (1986) *L'estàndard occidental: una proposta sobre l'estàndard català a les terres del darrer tram de l'Ebre*. Barcelona: Generalitat de Catalunya. Departament de Presidència.
- BIBILONI, Gabriel. (1997) *Llengua estàndard i variació lingüística*. València: Eliseu Climent.
- BIERBACH, Christine. (2000) "Cuatro idiomas para un Estado ¿cuántos para una Región Autónoma?". In: Bossong, Georg. *Identidades lingüísticas en la España autonómica*. Frankfurt am Main: Iberoamericana. p. 12-32.
- BRANCHADELL, Albert. (2007) "La interpretació al Senat espanyol". In: *Quaderns. Revista de traducció*. Number 14. p. 197-205.
- CABEZA I CÁCERES, Cristóbal. (2004) *Les dobles traduccions: el català i el valencià. El cas de Harry Potter i la pedra filosofal*. [MA thesis] Universitat Autònoma de Barcelona, Departament de Traducció i d'Interpretació.
- COLOMINA, Jordi. (2003) "Als germans de Catalunya". In: *Oc València: Paraula d'Oc*. Number 6. Electronic version: [http://www.oc-valencia.org/files/1\\_26.pdf](http://www.oc-valencia.org/files/1_26.pdf). [Last visited: 30th June 2009]
- COLOMINA, Jordi. (1995) *Els valencians i la llengua normativa*. València: Generalitat Valenciana. Conselleria d'Educació i Ciència: Institut de Cultura Juan Gil-Albert, Diputació d'Alacant.
- ESTEVE, Francesc; Josep Ferrer; Lluís Marquet & Juli Moll. (2001) "Harry Potter i la llengua migpartida". In: *El Temps*. Number 915. (València) (24th-30th December)
- GARCÍA GONZÁLEZ, Marta. (2006) *Aproximación ao estudo dos aspectos que regulan as actividades de mediación lingüística nas comunidades subordinadas*. [PhD Thesis]

- Universidade de Vigo, Facultade de Filoloxía e Traducción, Departamento de Lingüística e Traducción.
- GIFREU I PINSACH, Josep. (2007) *20 anys de l'espai català de comunicació: un objectiu encara possible?* [en línia] Conference hold the 21st June in the Facultat de Ciències de la Comunicació Blanquerna, Barcelona. URL: <http://www.vilaweb.tv/?video=4912&canal=33> [Last visited: 30th June 2009]
- HERMANS, Theo (ed.) (1985) *The Manipulation of Literature: Studies in Literary Translation*. London, Sydney: Croom Helm.
- HOLMES, James. (1977) "Translation Theory, Translation Theories, Translation Studies and the Translator". In: Holmes, James. 1994. *Translated: Papers on Literary Translation and Translation Studies*. Amsterdam: Rodopi B.V. p. 93-98.
- HURTADO ALBIR, Amparo. (2004) *Traducción y Traductología. Introducción a la Traductología*. 2a ed. Madrid: Cátedra.
- INSTITUT D'ESTUDIS CATALANS. (2002) *Gramàtica de la llengua catalana*. [en línia] Barcelona: Institut d'Estudis Catalans. URL: <http://www.iecat.net/institucio/seccions/Filologica/gramatica/default.asp> [Last visited: 30th June 2009]
- LEFEVERE, André. (1992) *Translation, Rewriting and the Manipulation of Literary Frame*. London, New York: Routledge.
- LLEI 7/1998, de 16 de setembre, de la Generalitat Valenciana, de Creació de l'Acadèmia Valenciana de la Llengua. [1998/7973] Electronic version: <http://www.avl.gva.es/PDF/LLEICREACIO.pdf> [Last visited: 30th June 2009]
- MARTÍ I BERTRAN, Pere. (2002) "La traducció de Harry Potter". In: *Llengua Nacional* Number 38. p. 26.
- MARZÀ I IBÀÑEZ, Anna. (2007) *Estudi descriptiu del model de llengua de la traducció per al doblatge en català. El cas de les sèries de televisió en el sistema valencià*. [MA thesis] Universitat Jaume I, Departament de Traducció i Comunicació.
- MIRA, Joan Francesc. (2002) "Sobre el no re, de res". In: *El Temps*. Number 922. (València) (12th-18th February).
- PINTER, Ester. (2001) "Harry Potter aixeca un debat sobre la versió dialectal dels llibres". In: *Diari Avui* (Barcelona) (20th November)
- PERGNIER, Maurice. (1978) *Les fondements socio-linguistiques de la traduction*. Lille: Presses Universitaires de Lille.
- PRADILLA, Miquel Àngel (ed.) (2001) *Societat, llengua i norma. A l'entorn de la normativització de la llengua catalana*. (Biblioteca Llengua i País; 5) Benicarló: Alambor.
- PUIGTOBELLA, Bernat. (2001) "Harry Potter també parla valencià". In: *Diari Avui* (Barcelona) (26th November 2001).
- RABADÁN, Rosa. (1991) *Equivalencia y traducción: Problemática de la equivalencia transléctica inglés-español*. León: Universidad de León.
- RAUSELL KÖSTER, Pau. (2002) "Economia de la llengua". In: Mollà, Toni. *Llengües globals, llegües locals*. Alzira: Bromera.
- SANCHIS GUARNER, Manuel. (1985) *La llengua dels valencians*. 10a edició. València: Eliseu Climent.
- SERRANO, Rosa. (2001) "Harry Potter, ara en valencià". In: *Levante, El Mercantil Valenciano*. (València) (25th November 2001)
- SOLÀ, Joan; Ramon Lapiedra; Artur Quintana; Brauli Montoya & Abelard Saragossà. (2004) "El nom del valencià en les lleis valencianes". In: *Presència*. Number 1676-1690 (9th April-16th July).
- SOLÀ, Joan. (2001) "Harry Potter". A *Diari Avui* (Barcelona) (29th November 2001)
- TOURY, Gideon. (1995) *Descriptive Translation Studies and Beyond*. Amsterdam/Philadelphia: John Benjamins. (2004) *Los estudios descriptivos de la traducción y más allá: metodología de la investigación en estudios de traducción*. Madrid: Cátedra.
- VAN DIJK, Teun Adrianus. (2003) *Ideología y discurso: un enfoque multidisciplinar*. Barcelona: Ariel.