

REWRITING THE MEMORY. TWENTY-FIVE YEARS OF NAVARRESE HISTORIOGRAPHY (6TH TO 12TH CENTURIES)

FERMÍN MIRANDA GARCÍA
UNIVERSIDAD AUTÓNOMA DE MADRID
SPAIN

Date of receipt: 28th of August, 2012
Final date of acceptance: 12th of December, 2012

ABSTRACT

The aim of this article is to provide a comparative study of the historiographic production higher Middle Ages in the Navarre area over the last twenty-five years¹. The starting point is fixed in the studies which followed the First General Congress of Navarre. Its lectures and communications initiate a comparative study and a starting point for new fields of work. The study is structured according to the principal research topics and attempts to set areas of debate, as well as the basic content and conclusions of the main contributions.

KEY WORDS

Navarre, Historiography, Historiographic Debate.

CAPITALIA VERBA

Navarra, Historiographia, Historiographicae disputationes.

1. This study is developed within the framework of the Research Project: *LESPOR. Los espacios del poder regio (1050-1350)*. 3. *Espacios de la memoria* (HAR2010-21725-C03-02 of the Spanish Ministry of Science and Innovation). Translation to English by María Dolores Novella.

Although the Navarre historiographic renewal of medieval times started long ago, with the work of José María Lacarra and his closest disciples, the relevance of which is unquestionable, we could take the I General Congress on Navarre History, held in 1986² as a symbolic starting point. The presentations given at the Congress, which consisted of a summary of previously developed issues and an indication of new lines of possible future work, in addition to the communications containing some of the challenges, as specific examples, may serve as an initial guide. We should consider the impossibility here, of analysing all the research that has taken place since José María Lacarra led the way towards methodological modernisation in 1930s, to which Navarre medieval studies are still grateful. In fact, the publication of the first volume of the congress proceedings symbolically coincided with the death of the renowned historian³.

With regard to the time frame of the study, the ideas arising from the Congress were developed by the principal heir to the 'Lacarra school' in the Navarre area, Ángel J. Martín Duque⁴, who progressively continued the process of renewal and whose extensive previous and equally relevant work⁵ can neither be studied in depth in this article. To the extent that the Congress not only analysed the current status of research, but also it different contributions, the brief and stimulating work by Professor Martín Duque makes it possible to continue just were he stopped. It must nevertheless be pointed out, although partially, that later approaches in this field have been made. In particular, the work of Luis Javier Fortún Pérez de Ciriza, on the occasion of the issue 200 of the *Príncipe de Viana* magazine regarding the studies on the early Middle Ages in this publication, is undoubtedly essential for a better understanding of that period. The time frame begins, of course, with the first publication in 1940 and ends in 1993⁶, with his article. Other contributions, although limited and focused on more specific topics will be included and quoted here, in the relevant sections of the study.

2. *Primer Congreso General de Historia de Navarra*. Pamplona: Gobierno de Navarra: I (Ponencias); III (Comunicaciones. Edad Media), 1987-1988.

3. 6 August 1987. His best-known work on medieval Navarre: Lacarra, José María. *Historia política del reino de Navarra desde sus orígenes hasta su incorporación a Castilla*. Pamplona: Caja de Ahorros de Navarra, 1972-1973, 3 vols. However, his career covers different fields of study, all of them with the same renewing criteria. To commemorate the centenary of his birth, the Government of Navarre entrusted his disciple, José Ángel Sesma, with the revised edition of his scattered and large work: José Ángel Sesma, ed. *Obra dispersa de José María Lacarra (1907-1987)*. Pamplona: Gobierno de Navarra, 2007-2011, 5 vols. In addition, he made reference to Lacarra's life and work: Sesma, José Ángel. "El discreto magisterio de Don José María Lacarra". *Jerónimo Zurita. Revista de Historia*, 73 (1998): 69-87.

4. Martín Duque, Ángel J. "Horizontes de la investigación en historia altomedieval navarra", *Primer Congreso General...: I*, 125-143.

5. It suffices to mention the re-edition of a great deal of his work during this preliminary phase in: Fermín Miranda García, ed. *Pirenaica*. Pamplona: Gobierno de Navarra, 2002 and the introductory pages referring to him in the compilation (Miranda García, Fermín. "Un (largo) café con don Ángel", *Pirenaica...: 559-564*) and especially in: Carrasco, Juan. "Martín Duque y la historiografía medieval Navarra". *Jerónimo Zurita. Revista de Historia*, 73 (1998): 49-67.

6. Fortún, Luis Javier. "Los siglos altomedievales en la revista *Príncipe de Viana*". *Príncipe de Viana*, 54 (1993): 573-584.



Having established the starting point of my analysis, the field of study should also be defined. Studies on the Middle Ages as a whole or those mainly focused on previous or later times, even if certain parts are within the framework of this study, will not be referred to in this article, except in justified cases. This decision is not so much based on scientific criteria, since many interesting proposals therefore may be left on the drawing board, but rather on methodological needs, given that the work would otherwise be impossible to carry out. Furthermore, it is well-known that the basque Pamplonese/Navarrese area also experienced substantial territorial change, which makes it more difficult to choose the work on topics that became or ceased to be part of the Pamplona/Navarre area during this period of time (La Rioja, Aragón, La Ribera, Gipuzkoa, Álava, Vizcaya, Ultrapuertos with all the novances that should be taken into account speaking about this territories over the centuries). Although the study has never been intended in great detail, let alone in this field, we have therefore established space-time limitations and considered these areas as long as they were related to the Kingdom of Pamplona/Navarre and to dealing exclusively with the most relevant issues. Volume and content reasons make it impossible to analyse with a certain degree of detail aspects related to artistic expression, the importance of which in 'general' history is considerable; however it requires special analysis to assess the contributions made.

It should be said that the following divisions are obviously debatable, as is the including of the work in each section and the reader may consider other options to be more adequate. The criteria applied are undoubtedly related to the author's interests and opinions and therefore subject to debate. The structure chosen is to be expected, as are the topics analysed, irrespective of the point of view employed and the greater or lesser renewal of methods and areas of interest.

1. Editions and studies of sources

Although most of the early and high medieval diplomatic records and reports have more or less recent editions, the value of certain publications in the last twenty-five years should not be overlooked. The study and edition of the proto-systematic texts of the Navarre "Fuero General" were published in 1987, as a result of the thesis written by Juan Utrilla Utrilla⁷, which replaced the already outdated version by P. Ilarregui and S. Lapuerta published in 1869 and re-edited by the former Provincial Government in 1964. In the same year, the *Revista Jurídica Navarra* dedicated its second issue to the Tudela Legal Code ("Fuero"), which has yet to be subject of a critical edition⁸. In the field of the chronicles, general recent approaches have re-evaluated the traditional consideration about the: the *Liber Regum* or *Libro de las*

7. Utrilla, Juan. *El Fuero General de Navarra, Estudio y edición de las redacciones protosistemáticas (series A y B)*. Pamplona: Gobierno de Navarra, 1987, 2 vols.

8. In 1994, Horacio Arrechea Silvestre presented his thesis *Estudio y edición crítica del Fuero de Tudela* (Universidad de Navarra), but it was not published, perhaps due to the early passing away of the author.



generaciones y linajes de los reyes, written around 1200 and awaiting a new edition, apparently underway⁹. Finally, with regard to this issues, it is worth mentioning the source review of the eighth to the tenth century by Alberto Cañada Juste¹⁰ and, above all, the work by Ángel Martín Duque, half comparative study, half overall conclusions¹¹.

After an important resurgence in previous decades, diplomatic editions still offer interesting contributions. Roldán Jimeno and Aitor Pescador published a complex edition of the documents of Sancho the Great¹² almost a millennium after the king's anniversary, which may require further critical analysis, given the problems related to the way documents have been preserved, specially some of them, as shown in specific cases¹³. In 1990, José Ángel Lema Pueyo published a meticulous diplomatic edition of the documents of Alfonso I¹⁴. In the same collection, the archive holdings of the Navarre General Archive for the periods of 1134 to 1194 and 1194 to 1234 have also been published¹⁵. On this basis, José María Jimeno Jurío and Roldán Jimeno Aranguren carried out a comprehensive review of Sancho VII's charts and substituted the hundred-year-old edition by C. Marichalar¹⁶. Finally, the documents of Pamplona's Cathedral were edited in 1997 by José Goñi, perhaps the most awaited work in this field in relation to the period of time at hand¹⁷. In addition, the first volume of the *Navarra Judaica*, which includes a large number of unpublished

9. In addition to the monographic issue by *e-Spania* (9 June 2010), it is worth mentioning the extremely convincing opinions on the chronology made by Martín, Carmen; Viruete, Roberto. "Contribución al estudio de la cultura escrita medieval de Navarra. Nueva propuesta de datación del *Liber regum*". *Príncipe de Viana*, 72 (2011): 375-386.

10. Cañada Juste, Alberto. "Historiografía navarra de los siglos VIII-X. Una aproximación a los textos". *Aragón en la Edad Media*, 14-15 (1999): 275-290. Despite its title, the analysis mainly focuses on external texts and not only local texts.

11. "Del espejo ajeno a la memoria propia", in: Martín Duque, Ángel; Martínez, Javier, eds. *Signos de identidad histórica para Navarra*. Pamplona: Caja de Ahorros de Navarra, 1996: I, 21-50.

12. *Colección documental de Sancho Garcés III, el Mayor, rey de Pamplona (1004-1035)*, eds. Roldán Jimeno, Aitor Pescador. Pamplona: Pamiela, 2003.

13. Juan José Larrea analysed this kind of problems in the particularly early and complex set of documents of the Aragonese Monastery of San Martín de Cillas. Larrea, Juan José. "La documentación de San Martín de Cillas, un ensayo de crítica de las fuentes altomedievales". *Revista de historia Jerónimo Zurita*, 61-62 (1991): 7-44. More focused on purely diplomatic issues, the work by: Martínez, Concha. "Las cláusulas conminatorias en los documentos de San Salvador de Leire, siglos IX, X y XI". *Segundo Congreso General de Historia de Navarra. 2. Prehistoria, Historia antigua, Historia medieval*, Pamplona: Gobierno de Navarra, 1992: 401-408.

14. *Colección Diplomática de Alfonso I de Aragón y Pamplona (1104-1134)*, ed. José Ángel Lema. San Sebastián: Eusko Ikaskuntza, 1990.

15. Lopetegui, Guadalupe; Pescador, Aitor. *Archivo General de Navarra (1134-1194)*. San Sebastián: Eusko Ikaskuntza, 1997; Jimeno, José M.; Jimeno, Roldán. *Archivo General de Navarra (1194-1234)*. San Sebastián: Eusko Ikaskuntza, 1998. Within the same collection, other editions compile Navarre documents prior to 13th century, but they are not included in this article since they mainly refer to later times.

16. *Colección documental de Sancho VII el Fuerte (1194-1234)*, eds. José María Jimeno, José Ángel Lema, Roldán Jimeno, David Mariezkurrena. Pamplona: Pamiela, 2008.

17. Goñi, José. *Colección diplomática de la Catedral de Pamplona. Tomo I (829-1243)*. Pamplona: Gobierno de Navarra, 1997.



diplomatic records, is considered an extremely important source of knowledge of the Jewish minority¹⁸.

Ángel Martín Duque's lecture at the I General Congress on Navarre History highlighted the importance of the archaeological evidence and its lack of relevance in historic research until then. Since then, the progress in early medieval archaeology has been prolific, but still seems to be eternally provisional, subjected to public works and the required explorations established by law, in the absence of systematic and adequate programming, far from the heavy impulse received in the eighties. The study by Carmen Jusué Simonena, *Poblamiento rural de Navarra en la Edad Media. Bases arqueológicas. Valle de Urraúl Bajo*¹⁹, which well exceeds the geographical framework limiting the study of materials and constitutes outstanding and pioneer work in this field by leading the way in research methodology, is a key element in highlighting the importance of archaeology in the reconstruction of population and socio-economic models. Following this study, the same author and other archaeologists published several detailed studies, almost always highly specific or focused on emergency archaeological exploration and works, the majority of which appear in the magazine *Trabajos de Arqueología Navarra*, which began publishing in 1979. Furthermore, the works involved in the restoration of the Pamplona and Tudela Cathedrals, as well as neighbouring areas, amongst others, are particularly noteworthy²⁰. Finally, mention should be made of the recent publication of a series of works published as a dossier called "Arqueología altomedieval de Vasconia y su entorno", intended in the majority of cases as a comparative study and recognition of the state of the issue²¹.

18. Carrasco, Juan; Miranda García, Fermín; Ramírez Vaquero, Eloísa. *Los Judíos del reino de Navarra. Documentos 1093-1333*. Pamplona: Gobierno de Navarra, 1994.

19. Jusué, Carmen. *Poblamiento rural de Navarra en la Edad Media. Bases arqueológicas. Valle de Urraúl Bajo*. Pamplona: Gobierno de Navarra, 1988. The same author made some conclusions on her own methodological approach in: Jusué, Carmen. "Arqueología de los despoblados medievales: una aproximación al conocimiento del mundo rural", *Paisajes rurales y paisajes urbanos. Métodos de análisis en Historia medieval. III Seminario de Historia Medieval*. Zaragoza: Universidad de Zaragoza, 1994: 103-121. More specific: Jusué, Carmen. "Apardués: un modelo de asentamiento rural en la Navarra medieval", *Arqueología medieval española. II Congreso*. Madrid: Asociación Española de Arqueología Medieval, 1987: 483-493.

20. Tabar, Inés; Jusué, Carmen. "Cerámica medieval navarra I: producción no vidriada". *Trabajos de arqueología Navarra*, 7 (1988): 273-318; Tabar, Inés; Mezquíriz, M^a Ángeles. "Excavaciones arqueológicas en la catedral de Pamplona". *Trabajos de arqueología Navarra*, 11 (1993-1994): 310-311; Martínez, Begoña; Bienes, Juan José; Martínez, José Manuel; Navas, Luis. "Excavaciones en la Plaza Vieja de Tudela: la Mezquita Mayor". *Trabajos de arqueología Navarra*, 11 (1993-1994): 137-139; Martínez, Begoña; Navas, Luis. "La excavación de urgencia de la Plaza Vieja (Tudela-1993): La necrópolis cristiana y nuevos datos sobre la Mezquita Aljama". *Trabajos de arqueología Navarra*, 12 (1995-1996): 91-174, or Ramos, Mikel. "Arqueología en la Autovía del Camino". *Trabajos de arqueología Navarra*, 21 (2009): 5-120, amongst other examples located in this period or mainly focused on it in most of their exposition.

21. The set of twelve contributions were published in: Quirós, Juan Antonio, coord. *Vasconia en la Alta Edad Media, 450-1000. Poderes y comunidades rurales en el norte peninsular*. Vitoria: Universidad del País Vasco, 2011: 119-279. The following contributions may be considered as relevant for their overall balance study: Ramos, Mikel. "Arqueología de los espacios rurales altomedievales en Navarra (450-1000)", *Vasconia en la*



The works with the greatest historiographic and even social impact were those carried out at the Plaza del Castillo in Pamplona to build a car park. Apart from remains from other periods, the discovery of certain materials linked to an important Muslim necropolis renewed most of the traditional beliefs relating to the presence of the Umayyad power in Navarre. The team that conducted the archaeological excavations published most of the results in different works²².

Faustino Menéndez Pidal's work on sigillography and heraldry has added to his many and essential contributions to the study of the reigns of Sancho VI and Sancho VII, the period during which the first examples of this type of record arose and whose value is clearly greater than that of a mere legal instrument linking the representation and exercising of power²³.

Although the value of works of art as an historical source of information is unquestionable, we cannot analyse the field in detail, for the reasons stated above. Contributions regarding sources from other fields are scarce, especially taking into account the specific time period, with the exception of contributions on toponymy, focused on Estella, by Fernando González Ollé and José María Jimeno Jurío²⁴ and a brief anthroponomical approach by José Ángel García de Cortazar²⁵, as well as by Concepción Fernández de la Pradilla and Javier García Turza, although only limited to La Rioja area when it belonged to the Kingdom of Pamplona²⁶.

Alta Edad Media, 450-1000...: 119-132; Sarasola, Nerea. "Investigaciones arqueológicas de época medieval en Gipuzkoa: Pasado, presente y futuro", Vasconia en la Alta Edad Media, 450-1000...: 133-144; García, Iñaki. "Arqueología de la Alta Edad Media en el País Vasco Cantábrico", Vasconia en la Alta Edad Media, 450-1000...: 145-162; Tejado, José María. "La Rioja en la Alta Edad Media a través de la Arqueología", Vasconia en la Alta Edad Media, 450-1000...: 163-180.

22. Faro, José Antonio; García, María; Unzu, Mercedes. "Pamplona y el Islam: nuevos testimonios arqueológicos". *Trabajos de arqueología Navarra*, 20 (2007-2008): 229-284; as well as "Las necrópolis pamplonesas del 700". *Zona arqueológica. Arqueología e Historia entre dos mundos*, 15 (2011): 295-312.

23. Amongst other examples: Menéndez, Faustino. "Un mandato original de Sancho VI de Navarra y los sellos de cierre del siglo XII". *Estudis castellanens*, 6 (1994-1995): 913-920; Menéndez, Faustino. "Primeros emblemas regiois". *Signos de identidad histórica para Navarra...*, I: 175-186.

24. González Ollé, Fernando. "Etimología del topónimo Estella". *Príncipe de Viana*, 51 (1990): 329-344; Jimeno, José María. "¿El nombre vasco de Los Arcos según el Fuero de Estella?". *Fontes Linguae Vasconum. Studia et documenta*, 22 (1990): 55-63.

25. García, José Ángel. "Antroponimia en Navarra y Rioja en los siglos X a XII", *Estudios de historia medieval*, Luís Suárez, Vicente A. Álvarez, Miguel Ángel Ladero, Julio Valdeón, eds. Valladolid: Universidad de Valladolid, 1991: 175-191.

26. Fernández, Concepción; García, Javier. "Contribución al estudio de la antroponimia riojana: siglos X-XI", *Segundo Congreso General de Historia...*: II, 365-373; García, Javier. "El sistema antroponímico en La Rioja a partir de la documentación de los monasterios de San Millán de la Cogolla y Valvanera hasta el año 1100", *Actas del Congreso Internacional de la Población: V Congreso de la ADEH. 3. La población del valle del Ebro en el pasado*, David S. Reher, coord. Logroño: Instituto de Estudios Riojanos, 1999: 161-180.



2. General works

The doctoral thesis by Juan José Larrea, *Peuplement et société de la fin du monde romain à l'Âge Féodal (IV^e-XII^e siècles)*²⁷, was published in microfilm format in 1994 and a new revised and summarised version in 1998²⁸. Despite the thematic framework suggested by the title, or perhaps for this reason, the analysis also covers aspects related to ideological transfer, sense of power, relation between *res publica* and *res privata*, all of which easily fit into this section. It is certainly a work of reference, due to its methodological innovation and scope of topics, with a perspective that clearly falls within the context of the models designed by the school of the director of the thesis, Pierre Bonnassie, for the Catalonian area or, in general terms, for the French Carolingian and post Carolingian Midi areas²⁹. Advocates of 'mutationism' will agree with many of the views expressed in the work. They will find the continuity of late Roman models during six centuries, including the preservation of the concept of public tax by the local elite and the monarchy of the 10th century. The necessary breakdown of the system, symbolised by the death of Sancho Garcés IV, takes place between 1035 and 1076, the interval consisting of the two generations following the reign of Sancho the Great. On the other hand, those with different views to these historiographic perspectives will undoubtedly consider some of the interpretations to be lacking sufficient source information or are based on inaccurate interpretations³⁰. However, the analysis fully coincides on one idea: the intense Romanisation of the territory before the Arab conquest, essential for the structure of the social and political model upon which the kingdom existing around 900 was based. Indeed, this idea is also the principle developed by Ángel Martín Duque, who disagrees with 'mutationism' models and whose approaches are explained in the chapters of *Historia de España de Menéndez Pidal*, which was published between 1992 and 1999³¹. However, in this case, the predominating idea is that the final result of the process, although coinciding, comes from a long evolution, with its ups

27. Directed by Pierre Bonnassie.

28. Larrea, Juan José. *La Navarre du IV^e- XII^e siècles. Peuplement et société*. Bruxelles: De Boeck, 1998. He analysed again some of the essential aspects of his approach in: Larrea, Juan José. "Rasgos distintivos del proceso de feudalización en Navarra", *El temps i l'espai del feudalisme*, Flocel Sabaté, Joan Farré, eds. Lleida: Pagès Editors, 2004: 185-196.

29. A role model which inspired in some way the work by Sesma, Ángel. "Instituciones feudales en Navarra y Aragón", *En Torno al feudalismo hispánico: I Congreso de Estudios Medievales*. Ávila: Fundación Sánchez-Albornoz, 1989: 341-371.

30. See critical note by Fermín Miranda García to the 1998 edition in *Huarte de San Juan* magazine. *Geografía e Historia*, 6 (1999): 297-299.

31. Martín Duque, Ángel. "El reino de Pamplona, 718-1035", *Historia de España*, Ramón Menéndez Pidal, ed. Madrid: Espasa Calpe, 1999: VII/2: 39-266; Martín Duque, Ángel. "Declive del reino de Pamplona y crecimiento aragonés, 1035-1076"; "El despliegue del reino de Aragón y Pamplona, 1076-1134", *Historia de España...*, 1998: IX: 237-323; Martín Duque, Ángel (in collaboration with Eloísa Ramírez Vaquero). "Aragón y Navarra. Instituciones, economía y sociedad. Siglos XI y XII", *Historia de España...*, 1992: X/2, 335-444. The chapter "Del reino de Pamplona al reino de Navarra (1134-1217)", on the period of this study, is also remarkable and was signed by his disciple, L. Javier Fortún Pérez de Ciriza; Fortún, Luis Javier. "Del reino de Pamplona al reino de Navarra (1134-1217)", *Historia de España...*: IX, 607-660.



and downs, during which the always underlying model of the Isidorian monarchy does not prevent a continuous transition from the late Roman public tax authorities and their social and economic networks towards the private and feudal system of the final stage³². In the sections below, regarding more specific work, the different special features of the two lines of thinking and other alternatives are discussed.

3. Times of transition (5th-8th centuries)

The intensity and quality of the relations between the “vascones” and the different governing authorities in Hispania and Gaul were the most repeated topics in historiographic analysis for decades or even centuries. The above mentioned overall studies highlight the strong presence of Hispano-Gothic and also Arab power immediately following the invasion of 711. Nevertheless, there have also been studies that, according to pure tradition, tend to downplay this approach and insist on the importance of a “vasconic” area, with little internal structure, although reluctant to be dominated by these powers, if not radically opposed. Some authors, such as Mikel Poza³³, claim the elimination of certain stereotypes, which were easily accepted for decades in the analysis of sources. Nevertheless, the tendency to identify “vascones”/barbarism/rebelliousness still underlies in studies of compiling and analysing which are worthy, even when the existence of an Aquitanian-Vasconian *koiné* may be proposed to justify the warmongering nature of such people, a community with shared interests that was to develop beyond cultural aspects on both sides of the Pyrenees and which was the result of simultaneous pressure by Goths and Franks. The more romanised Aquitanian people would have established an independent area influencing less romanised Vasconian areas³⁴. However, other studies explain the confrontations using the internal logic of Hispano-Goth and Frankish-Merovingian power³⁵. Other authors, such as Roldán Jimeno, nevertheless consider that the undeniable intensity of Roman culturisation did not prevent local customary models from surviving, models that the Hispano-

32. A brief overall comparative study with the main argument lines, Martín Duque, Ángel. “Vasconia en la Alta Edad Media. Somera aproximación histórica”. *Revista Internacional de Estudios Vascos*, 44 (1999): 399-439. Regarding the political trajectory of the kingdom, see also: Martín Duque, Ángel. “Del reino de Pamplona al reino de Navarra”, *Signos de identidad histórica...: I*, 145-154.

33. Poza, Mikel. “La barbarie como explicación histórica y sus problemas: los vascones de los siglos VI y VII”. *Miscelánea medieval murciana*, 35 (2011): 189-200.

34. Azkarate, Agustín. “Francos, aquitanos y vascones. Testimonios arqueológicos al sur de los Pirineos”. *Archivo español de arqueología*, 66 (1993): 149-176; Azkarate, Agustín. “Algunas consideraciones sobre el siglo VII en el entorno circumpirenaico occidental”, *1º Congreso de Arqueología Peninsular: (Porto, 12-18 de Outubro de 1993): actas*, Oporto: Sociedade Portuguesa de Antropologia e Etnologia, 1994: IV, 307-329. More recent but following the same line, Azkarate, Agustín. “Repensando los márgenes circumpirenaicos-occidentales durante los siglos VI y VII”. *Arqueología e Historia entre dos mundos*, 15 (2011): 241-253.

35. Pavón, Júlía. “*Pompaelo* y su distrito en la época hispano-goda”. *Anuario de Estudios Medievales*, 30 (2000): 3-16.



Gothic authorities found difficult to control³⁶. Along the same lines, Armando Besga analyses the Germanic period as the interruption of Roman cultural continuity in most of the Vasconic territory, as well as the reinforcement of local values³⁷.

The debate has been more intense with respect to the presence of Pamplona bishops on Hispano-Gothic church councils and the extent to which such presence constitutes the participation of the local ecclesiastic and noble elite in the power structures of the Kingdom of Toledo. Juan José Larrea considers that episcopal collaboration is not particularly different from that provided by other peripheral dioceses of the Hispano-Gothic Kingdom. It would be a clear example of the local elite committed to the political power of Toledo, to the same extent and with the same contradictions as in the rest of the kingdom, in a similar decentralised situation. Koldo Larrañaga maintains that the intense relations are, in fact, not so intense, if not forced, which obviously leads him to very different conclusions³⁸.

According to M. Concepción Fernández López, *De laude Pampilonae* was written in this complex context. The poem was copied and distributed at the end of the 10th century. According to said author, the poem was written during the middle of the 6th century, therefore with a strong Roman-Gothic cultural influence (with no contradiction). K. Larrañaga sets the poem in the context of Carolingian models and, consequently, in the short period of Frankish control of the city, at the beginning of the 9th century³⁹.

In the previous stages of Frankish control of Pamplona, one of the most famous battles in European history took place, not so much due to its actual repercussion, but rather to the related literary cycle: Roncesvalles. Armando Besga again analysed the battle and its rivals, to highlight, contrary to A. Martín Duque's ideas, the South-Pyrenean origin of the Vasconic forces which defeated Charlemagne and minimise the importance of the battle; also, after comparing different sources⁴⁰, Pedro

36. Jimeno, Roldán. "Vascones y visigodos: Análisis iushistórico de la organización militar", *Los vascones en las fuentes antiguas. En torno a una etnia de la antigüedad peninsular*. Barcelona: UAB, 2009: 253-260.

37. Armando Besga, Ani Elorza, Ángel Domínguez, Enrique García, Sara Madariaga, eds. *Domuit vascones. El País Vasco durante la época de los reinos germánicos. La era de la independencia (siglos V-VIII)*. Bilbao: Librería Anticuaria Astarloa, 2001; also, Besga, Armando. "El concepto de vascón en las fuentes durante los siglos VI-IX". *Letras de Deusto*, 23 (1993): 57-84.

38. The open debate in *Hispania Sacra* was informed by four articles of different extension but same intensity: Larrea, Juan José. "El obispado de Pamplona en época visigoda". *Hispania Sacra*, 48 (1996): 123-147; Larrañaga, Koldo. "Sobre el obispado pamplonés en época visigoda". *Hispania Sacra*, 49 (1997): 279-317; Larrea, Juan José. "De nuevo en torno a los primeros siglos del obispado de Pamplona". *Hispania Sacra*, 49 (1997): 319-326; Larrañaga, Koldo. "A vueltas con los obispos de Pamplona de época visigoda: apostillas a una réplica". *Hispania Sacra*, 50 (1998): 35-62.

39. As it's generally known, the poem appears in the Roda Codex, compiled at the end of the 10th century, along with a letter by the emperor Honorio addressed to Pamplona citizens, which was written around 418. Fernández, M. Concepción. "Una lectura del *De laude Pampilonae epistola*", *Actes del IX^e Simposi de la Secció Catalana de la SEEC (Societat Espanyola d'Estudis Clàssics)*, Lambert Ferreres, Virgilio Bejarano, eds. Barcelona: Sociedad Española de Estudios Clásicos, Secció Catalana-Publicacions de la Universitat de Barcelona, 1991: I, 395-402; Larrañaga, Koldo. "Glosa sobre un viejo texto referido a la historia de Pamplona: el *De laude Pampilonae*". *Príncipe de Viana*, 55 (1994): 137-147.

40. Besga, Armando. "Vencedores, vencidos y Roncesvalles". *Letras de Deusto*, 29 (1999): 9-46; Chalmeta, Pedro. "Rozaballes and Bernardo". *Arabica: Journal of Arabic and Islamic Studies / Revue d'études arabes et*



Chalmeta locates the possible venue of the battle in the Aragonese mountains, as Antonio Ubieta had done.

4. Muslim dominance

Studies on the period of Muslim dominance are still pending as part of the historiographic renewal. Apart from the archaeological contributions mentioned above, only half a dozen studies of varying levels of interest are worth reviewing. They include the overall analysis by Jesús Lorenzo Jiménez and Ernesto Díaz de Garayo, although limited to the 8th century, which highlights a greater degree of territorial control than traditionally accepted⁴¹. Also, in the sociopolitical arena, J. Lorenzo has made a profound and from now an indispensable revision on the *Banū Qāṣī*, the family that dominated the central Ebro valley until the beginning of the 10th century. Their genuine political ascent would have occurred after their conversion to Islam⁴². With regard to territorial organisation, there is a brief descriptive balance on the hierarchy of settlements in the regions around Tudela⁴³ and a few studies relating to the medina and walls of Olite⁴⁴ and Tudela, in this particular case in relation to the importance of water as an instrument of social and economic organisation⁴⁵.

islamiques, 55 (2008): 122-131.

41. Lorenzo, Jesús; Díaz, Ernesto. "Al-Ándalus, ¿en la periferia de Vasconia?", *Vasconia en la Alta Edad Media, 450-1000...*: 55-70.

42. Lorenzo, Jesús. *La dawla de los banu-Qasi; origen, auge y caída de una dinastía muladí en la frontera superior de al-Ándalus*. Madrid: Consejo Superior de Investigaciones Científicas, 2010. On conversion to Islam, Pavón, Julia. "Muladíes. Lectura política de una conversión: los Banū Qāṣī (714-924)". *Anaquel de Estudios Árabes*, 17 (2006): 189-201.

43. Souto, Juan A. "El noroeste de la Frontera superior de al-Ándalus en época omeya: poblamiento y organización territorial", *García Sánchez III "el de Nájera". Un rey y un reino en la Europa del siglo XI*, José I. de la Iglesia, coord. Logroño: IER, 2005: 253-267. It is an extract of his work on "El noroeste de la frontera superior de al-Ándalus en época omeya: los datos de las fuentes geográficas e históricas". *Boletín de la Asociación Española de Orientalistas*, 29-32 (1993-1996): 273-290, 267-279, 59-72 and 265-282, of larger territorial and thematic scope.

44. Cabañero, Bernabé. "La madina islámica de Olite, Navarra: claves para el estudio de su conjunto amurallado", *Simposio internacional sobre la ciudad islámica: ponencias y comunicaciones*, Mikel de Epalza, José Luis Corral, ed. Zaragoza: IFC, 1991: 303-320. The author suggests that the walls may be Arab, which would imply that the importance of the population at this time period would have been higher than traditionally accepted.

45. Hernández, M. Carmen. "Agua y poblamiento: notas sobre la configuración del territorio de Tudela andalusí". *Studia historica. Historia medieval*, 24 (2006): 315-339; Hernández, M. Carmen. "Las transformaciones de la medina de Tudela y su impacto en el paisaje rural andalusí a raíz de la conquista cristiana. Una cuestión sobre la organización de los sistemas y recursos acuíferos", *La Ciudad medieval y su influencia territorial*, Beatriz Arízaga, Jesús A. Solórzano, eds. Logroño: Instituto de Estudios Riojanos, 2007: 381-394.



5. Political history and power

The deep-rooted historiographic tradition of Navarre medievalism, whose publications in terms of political history have always been abundant, has not weakened. Although it is true that the new thematic and methodological trends, which are focused on the ideology and building of power, have gained prominence with respect to studies more closely linked to the old habits of the study of the history of events, perhaps because they are already well-known.

The study on the first era of development of the Kingdom of Pamplona (10th century) and even the immediately preceding period, in which the fundamental bases of the new political territory were established, has experienced a considerable boost in the last ten years. The continuity of genetics and family relations between the groups in power under the Muslim dominance and those forming part of the new kingdom has been observed⁴⁶. There have been convincing arguments to support the importance of the relations of submissiveness and collaboration, and not only of conflict, when it exist, with the Andalusian authorities that facilitated the final step towards the creation of a new kingdom. The convergence of such interaction with previous Roman-Christian (and Hispano-Gothic) cultural models would have provided simple but solid ideological pillars from the beginning⁴⁷. It would have even contributed, from another perspective, to a better understanding of the rapid military advance in the Alta Rioja region during a period of apparent military weakness, although the innovative hypothesis in this respect put forth by David Peterson may require further analysis⁴⁸.

The areas of debate now focus on the maturing of this ideological program and the influence of Neo-Gothicism, which was extremely evident in the cultural archetypes built within the ecclesiastic sectors of the Court during the last quarter of the 10th century. For certain authors, such as J. J. Larrea and Á. Martín Duque, in the overall studies mentioned above⁴⁹, Neo-Gothicism is almost the only and natural result of prior tradition, even if nourished by the intense relations with the Kingdom of León-Asturias. The same line of argument was defended by Manuel Díaz y Díaz in his classic work⁵⁰ and continued, amongst other authors, by Helena de Carlos

46. Cañada, Alberto. "En los albores del reino ¿dinastía Íñiga? ¿dinastía Jimena?". *Príncipe de Viana*, 72 (2011): 229-248.

47. Larrea, Juan José. "Construir un reino en la periferia de al-Ándalus: Pamplona y el Pirieno occidental en los siglos VIII y IX". *Territorio, sociedad y poder. Revista de Estudios Medievales*, Anejo 2 (2009): 279-308.

48. This author proposes that Pamplona control of La Rioja would have been largely due to approval by Cordoba (he refers to 'patronage' at the service of Cordoba) to stop pressure from León, Peterson, David. "En torno a la conquista cristiana de la Rioja Alta (918-925)". *Brocar*, 31 (2007): 155-176.

49. See footnotes 28 and 31. Also, more specific, Martín Duque, Ángel. "La realeza navarra de cuño hispano-godo y su ulterior metamorfosis". *Annexes des Cahiers de linguistique et de civilisation hispaniques médiévales*, 15 (2003): 225-241.

50. A continuation in: Díaz, Manuel. "Tradiciones culturales librerías en el reino de Pamplona", *Ante el milenario del reinado de Sancho el Mayor. Un rey para España y Europa*. Pamplona: Gobierno de Navarra, 2004: 197-211.



in some of her studies on the Roda Codex⁵¹. In the opinion of others, such as the author of this paper, apart from the previous cultural substratum, Neo-Gothicism would have only progressed as of mid-century, especially promoted by intellectual and family circles closely linked to León. There are also significant post-Carolingian and even Ottonian elements of influence, which played a considerable and almost leading role in certain cases⁵², all of which despite discarding, as demonstrated by A. Cañada, a possible visit by Sancho Garcés I to the Aquitanian sanctuary of Remiremont, traditionally considered as a sign of the friendship network fixed by the king beyond the Pyrenees⁵³. These ideological, contemporary, concurrent or opposed, models obviously had their ritual expression, which was logically subject to the changes in the monarchy during the following centuries⁵⁴.

Different studies aimed at renewing and/or compiling knowledge on the king and his time were published around the one thousandth anniversary of Sancho III the Great in 2004, although others sought to repeat some of the many common topics dealt with by historiographers over the centuries. In addition an absolutely necessary scientific encounter and a magnificent commemorative exhibition were held⁵⁵. The beginning of the reign, traditionally dated in 1004, has been discussed and it is now widely accepted that it should be brought forward a few years to 999 or 1000⁵⁶, even though as a minority until 1004, which is to a certain extent maintained as a symbolic reference.

Prior to these “millennium” contributions⁵⁷, Carmen Orcástegui and Esteban Sarasa had already provided a synthesis of the king's reign, which was later revised

51. de Carlos, Helena. “A loa de Pamplona do Códice de Roda: unha nova achega”, *As tebras alumeadas*, Ana Isabel Boullón, coord. Santiago de Compostela: USC, 2005: 103-114; de Carlos, Helena. “À l'ombre de Rome: les villes de Tolède et Pampelune dans le codex de Roda”. *Cahiers de civilisation médiévale, X^e-XII^e siècles*, 51 (2008): 129-142; de Carlos, Helena. “El Códice de Roda (Madrid, BRAH 78) como compilación de voluntad historiográfica”. *Edad Media: revista de historia*, 12 (2011): 119-142. See also: Besga, Armando. “Orígenes hispano-godos del Reino de Pamplona”. *Letras de Deusto*, 89 (2000): 11-15.

52. Miranda García, Fermín. “Imagen del poder monárquico en el reino de Pamplona del siglo X”, *Navarra: memoria e imagen*. Pamplona: Eunat, 2007: 73-95; Miranda García, Fermín. “De laude Pampilonae y la construcción ideológica de una capital regia en el entorno del año 1000”, *Ab urbe condita. Fonder et refonder la ville: récits et représentations (seconde moitié du Moyen Âge — premier XVI^e siècle)*, Véronique Lamazou-Duplan, ed. Pau: Presses Universitaires de Pau, 2011: 293-308.

53. Cañada, Alberto. “Sobre la supuesta presencia de Sancho Garcés I de Pamplona en la abadía de Remiremont”, *Segundo Congreso General de Historia de Navarra...: II*, 325-329.

54. Miranda García, Fermín. “La realeza navarra y sus rituales (905-1234)”, *El Ceremonial de la coronación, unción y exequias de los reyes de Inglaterra del Archivo General de Navarra*. Eloísa Ramírez Vaquero, ed. Navarra: Gobierno de Navarra, 2008: 253-277.

55. The result of both of them, which is essential to know more details of the reign and the time period, is compiled respectively in: *Ante el milenario del reinado de Sancho el Mayor...* and in Bango, Isidro, coord., *Sancho el Mayor y sus herederos. El linaje que europeizó los reinos hispanos*. Pamplona: Gobierno de Navarra, 2006, 2 vols. Some of the studies published there are specifically quoted in the relevant section.

56. In 1986, the first author to draw attention to this subject was Cañada, Alberto. “Un posible interregno en la monarquía pamplonesa, 1000-1004”, *Primer Congreso General...: III*, 15-18.

57. On the occasion of the chronological millennium, 1000-2000, Carlos Laliena contributed with a brief general view on the Navarre-Aragon area (“Aragón y Navarra al filo del año 1000”) to the collective



and completed in a second version by the latter author⁵⁸. Such approach offered a comparative study of the progress of historiography in relation to the reign, with a breakdown of some of the most recurring elements created in this regard, ranging from the excessive imperialism to the breaking of the Hispanic unity supposedly achieved during the period of rule. Accordingly, the work by Ángel J. Martín Duque is the most complete and contextualised perspective of the king, both in time and space, although sometimes difficult to follow, particularly due to the accumulating of very different ideas⁵⁹. Certainly a 'Hispanist' perspective and possibly even more so, is the work by Gonzalo Martínez Díez, of a more traditional and closer approach to the history of events⁶⁰. A completely different picture of the king and his governing acts is outlined in the work of Aitor Pescador, closer to the image of a Vasconian king who structures a political system based on the same culture for centuries, which now would reach its territorial and institutional peak⁶¹.

Other partial studies have contributed to even further clarifying the political and legal link between the different territories managed by the king and therefore how the heirs inherited such territories⁶² or have again analysed the territorial division agreement between the king and the Castilian count Sancho, the importance of which goes far beyond a simple legal agreement⁶³, to address the issues of nobility and family links or the very concept of the sovereignty or legitimacy of power; a

work del Pino, José Luís, ed. *La Península Ibérica al filo del año 1000*. Córdoba: Fundación Prasa, 2008: 459-471.

58. Orcástegui, Carmen; Sarasa, Esteban. *Sancho III, el Mayor (1004-1035)*. Burgos: La Olmeda, 2000. The first version *Sancho Garcés III, el Mayor (1004-1035)*. Pamplona: Mintzoa, 1987, had been edited within the collection *Reyes de Navarra* by the publishing house Mintzoa. Since they were published before our starting point in 1988, as well as other studies of the series relating to kings prior to 1234, they are not referred to in this article, although other of later edition are quoted.

59. Martín Duque, Ángel. *Sancho III el Mayor. El rey y su reino*. Pamplona: Gobierno de Navarra, 2006. The same author made a first approach in the *Semana de Estudios Medievales de Estella*, held for commemorating purposes: Martín Duque, Ángel. "Sancho III el Mayor de Navarra, entre la leyenda y la historia", *Ante el milenario del reinado de Sancho el Mayor...: 19-42*. More widespread published in "Sancho el Mayor y su reino navarro. Antecedentes y contextura sociopolítica e ideológica", in Benito, Eloy, coord. *Sancho III el Mayor de Navarra*. Madrid: Real Academia de la Historia, 2003: 61-78. This volume contained as well contributions by Eloy Benito, Julio Valdeón, Luis Suárez and Miguel Ángel Ladero.

60. Martínez, Gonzalo. *Sancho III el Mayor. Rey de Pamplona, Rex Ibericus*. Madrid: Marcial Pons, 2007.

61. Pescador, Aitor. "Historia de un reino y un reinado", *Vasconia en el siglo XI. Reinado de Sancho III el Mayor, rey de Pamplona (1004-1035)*, Manex Goyhenetche *et alii*, eds. Pamplona: Pamiela, 2004.

62. Miranda García, Fermín. "Monarquía y espacios de poder político en el reino de Pamplona (1000-1035)", *Ante el milenario del reinado de Sancho el Mayor...: 43-70*; also, Martínez, Gonzalo. "La frontera de Castilla con el reino de Pamplona en el siglo XI". *Boletín de la Institución Fernán González*, 241 (2010): 249-266, with regard to the Castilian areas controlled by García III el de Nájera.

63. Peterson, David. "De división regno". *Poder magnático en la sierra de la Demanda en el siglo XI*. *Brocar*, 29 (2005): 7-26. Within a broader context but especially focused on this issue: Martín Duque, Ángel. "Definición de espacios y fronteras en los reinos de Asturias-León y Pamplona hasta el siglo XI", *Los Espacios de poder en la España medieval*, José I. de la Iglesia, coord. Logroño: Instituto de Estudios Riojanos, 2002: 315-339.



subject on which other new proposals have been stated, relating to Pamplona Neo-Gothicism⁶⁴.

Pamplona epigones of Sancho III were also commemorated in 2004. The Battle of Atapuerca, which ended with the reign of García III and initiated that of Sancho IV, celebrated its 950th anniversary. Apart from the battle itself⁶⁵, the event gave rise to a renewed study of both kings, on the occasion of the Week dedicated to García III in Nájera. With regard to this section, the works by Ángel Martín Duque, Eloísa Ramírez Vaquero and Juan José Larrea deals with models of power in their respective lines of work. Nevertheless, since this period is 'between the old and new establishments', as stated by Larrea, the approaches somewhat converge⁶⁶. The eventual period of the reign and assassination of Sancho IV undoubtedly requires a complete historiographic review to analyse the figure of the king, his reign and the relevant context, without stereotypes, which may often represent a romantic vision of history, with the good and the bad (while the king plays a secondary role), from which even the most renowned historians are unable to escape⁶⁷.

The Aragonese branch of the dynasty, which produced the kings of Pamplona from 1076, had better fortune. Certain recent monographic studies have analysed the life and government of the three kings, with a different degree of intensity and complexity. The works on Pedro I and Alfonso I by Carlos Laliena and José Ángel Lema, both dealt with by the two authors, must be added to those on Sancho Ramírez by Domingo Buesa, Ana Isabel Lapeña and the studies coordinated by Esteban Sarasa. Although most of these studies are in the form of synthesis⁶⁸ or

64. García, Luís. "Estirpe goda y legitimidad del poder en tiempos de Sancho el Mayor", *Ante el milenario del reinado de Sancho el Mayor...*: 271-317.

65. Besga, Armando. "La batalla de Atapuerca". *Letras de Deusto*, 39 (2009): 9-62.

66. de la Iglesia, José I., coord. *García Sánchez III "el de Nájera". Un rey y un reino en la Europa del siglo XI*. Logroño: IER, 2005. Studies of the quoted authors: Martín Duque, Ángel. "Don García Sánchez III 'el de Nájera'. Biografía de un reinado", *García Sánchez III "el de Nájera". Un rey y un reino...*: 17-38; Ramírez Vaquero, Eloísa. "El rey García y sus hermanos. Enfrentamiento de reyes, enfrentamiento de reinos", *García Sánchez III "el de Nájera". Un rey y un reino...*: 93-119, and Larrea, Juan José, "El reinado de García de Nájera, entre el viejo y el nuevo orden: Rey, barones e infanzones entre la monarquía isidoriana y la feudal", *García Sánchez III "el de Nájera". Un rey y un reino...*: 151-170.

67. With regard to political history, it is worth mentioning the article by Besga, Armando. "La guerra de los tres sanchos y otros supuestos conflictos navarro-castellanos del reinado de Sancho IV el de Peñalén (1054-106)". *Letras de Deusto*, 39 (2009): 9-58; and the territorial consequences of the assassination, recently analysed by Santamaría, Ricardo. "La muerte de un rey. Repercusiones territoriales del asesinato de Sancho IV Garcés (1076) en el área navarro-riojana". *Príncipe de Viana*, 72 (2011): 249-262; a study that supplements a previous one on the occupation of La Rioja area by Alfonso VI: Santamaría, Ricardo. "Factores de control del territorio en tiempos de Alfonso VI de Castilla (1065/1072-1109): el ejemplo del área riojana". *Miscelánea Medieval Murciana*, 33 (2009): 185-194.

68. Sarasa, Esteban, coord. *Sancho Ramírez, rey de Aragón, y su tiempo (1064-1094)*. Huesca: IEA, 1994 is focused on the Aragonese sector of the kingdom, as indicated by the title, but separation of Navarre and Aragon areas seems impossible in many sections of the work. The following studies are part of the series Corona de España initiated by the publishing house La Olmeda and continued by Trea: Lapeña, Ana Isabel. *Sancho Ramírez, rey de Aragón (¿1064?-1094) y rey de Navarra (1076-1094)*. Gijón: Trea, 2004; Laliena, Carlos. *Pedro I de Aragón y Navarra*. Burgos: La Olmeda, 2001; and Lema, José Ángel. *Alfonso I el Batallador, rey de Aragón y Pamplona (1104-1134)*. Gijón: Trea, 2008.



even intended for widespread publication⁶⁹, which in any way affects the quality, two of them represent a detailed review of the knowledge about the kings. Beyond the title, the study by Carlos Laliena, *La formación del estado feudal. Aragón y Navarra en la época de Pedro I*, contains profound conclusions on the institutional and ideological structures of the reign and its precedents, covering all the 11th century and even earlier times, linking to other topics mentioned above, such as the Hispano-Gothic influence (and its absence) or feudal deployment; the use of terms such as ‘pre-feudalism’, ‘feudal state’ and ‘renaissance of the reign’ reflects the complexity and possibilities of debate offered by the text⁷⁰. Perhaps using more descriptive parameters, the work *Instituciones políticas del reinado de Alfonso I* by José Ángel Lema⁷¹ proclaims the full consolidation of the feudal model in its different aspects and supports the use of the term by historiographers, who are some times reluctant to do so.

The ‘returning’ of García III’s descendants to the throne as of 1134 closes this chronological overview of historiography on political power. Biographies of the first representative of the monarchy, García Ramírez, as well as of Sancho VI were published in the years covered by this paper, the first more descriptive and the second more analytical, by young researchers at the time⁷², however in both cases a necessary social and ideological contextualisation was sought—or achieved—at a time when the ideological framework of government acts reached extraordinary levels. Said contextualisation is the fundamental reference of the work by Luis Javier Fortún on Sancho VII and especially on his relations with Castile, where the conquest of the western regions of the kingdom by Alfonso VIII of Castile and the involvement of the local nobility in the process became highly significant⁷³. The ideological framework undoubtedly represents the main concern of the latest

69. Buesa, Domingo J. *Sancho Ramírez, rey de aragoneses y pamploneses (1064-1094)*. Zaragoza: Ibercaja, 1996.

70. Laliena, Carlos. *La formación del estado feudal. Aragón y Navarra en la época de Pedro I*. Huesca: Instituto de Estudios Altoaragoneses, 1996. Some of the topics included here are further developed in “Guerra sagrada y poder real en Aragón y Navarra en el transcurso del siglo XI”, *Guerre, pouvoirs et idéologies dans l’Espagne chrétienne aux alentours de l’an mil*, Thomas Deswarte, Philippe Sénac, ed. Turnhout: Brepols, 2005: 97-119.

71. Lema, José Ángel. *Instituciones políticas del reinado de Alfonso I el Batallador, rey de Aragón y Pamplona (1104-1134)*. Vitoria: Universidad del País Vasco, 1997. Among the numerous studies by José Ángel Lema on Alfonso I during these years and on these issues, it is worth mentioning as well Alfonso I “‘El Batallador’ y el Condado de Navarra”. *Mundaiz*, 41 (1991): 67-76; Lema, José Ángel. “Apuntes para el estudio de una coyuntura crítica en el reino de Pamplona, 1110-1117”, *Segundo Congreso General de Historia de Navarra...*: II, 395-400; Lema, José Ángel. “El itinerario de Alfonso I ‘El batallador’ (1104-1134)”. *Historia, instituciones, documentos*, 24 (1997): 333-354.

72. Domínguez, Enrique; Larrambebere, Miguel. *García Ramírez el Restaurador (1134-1150)*. Pamplona: Mintzoa, 1994; Elizari, Juan Francisco. *Sancho VI el Sabio*. Pamplona: Mintzoa, 1991, both within the collection *Reyes de Navarra* previously mentioned, in which the volume on Sancho VII was published in 1986 by Luis Javier Fortún, the reason why it is not more specifically referred to in this article.

73. Fortún, Luís Javier. “La quiebra de la soberanía navarra en Álava, Guipúzcoa y el Duranguésado (1199-1200)”. *Revista Internacional de Estudios Vascos*, 45 (2000): 439-494; Fortún, Luís Javier. “De la tempestad al sosiego: Navarra y Castilla en la primera mitad del siglo XIII”, *Fernando III y su tiempo (1201-1252): VIII Congreso de Estudios Medievales*. León: Fundación Sánchez Albornoz, 2003: 259-304.



research on the era: from an external perspective, through the international recognition of the kingdom by the Holy See and fully benefiting from family links (in particular, through the Normans⁷⁴); and from an internal perspective, in addition to urban development aimed at uniting the kingdom, which will be further analysed below, through greater administrative centralisation, progressively supported by the use of chanceries, which is represented in the choice of Romance as an instrument for cohesion, but also for control⁷⁵. Of course, apart from the kings themselves, there are also studies on certain fundamental characters in the process, such as Rodrigo Jiménez de Rada and his involvement in Navarre issues from his privileged seat in Toledo, but also through his local family support, appears increasingly evident⁷⁶.

6. Territorial planning

Obviously, under such a title, there are issues closely related to government systems and their social-economic components, most if not all of which could have therefore been included in such sections. Nevertheless, a specific although brief section was considered worthy of inclusion, given the histiographic perspective and interest in the topic.

Julia Pavón Benito comprehensively analyses the population network in the Navarre area —although limited to the territory which more or less coincides with present day Navarre— over these centuries in different works, the most specific being the publication of her thesis⁷⁷. Other approaches to the topic have preferred models that are more limited in time and/or space, although more abundant in

74. Ramírez Vaquero, Eloísa; Gallego, Javier. “El papado y los títulos de *rex pampilonensium* y *rex portugalensium*”, *Actas das II Jornadas Luso-Espanholas de História Medieval*. Oporto: Instituto de Cultura e Língua Portuguesa, 1990: IV, 3-10; Ramírez Vaquero, Eloísa. “Reflexiones en torno a la construcción de la realeza en el siglo XII: a propósito de un matrimonio siciliano en la dinastía navarra”, *Memoria, storia e identità. Scritti per Laura Sciascia*, Marcello Pacifico, Laura Sciascia et alii, eds. Palermo: Associazione Mediterranea, 2011: II, 679-700; Miranda García, Fermín. “Intereses cruzados de la monarquía navarra en el siglo XIII (1194-1270)”, *Fernando III. Tiempo de Cruzada*, Carlos de Ayala, Martín Ríos, coords. Madrid: Ed. Sílex, 2012.

75. Lopetegui, Guadalupe. “Escribas y notarios en la cancillería real navarra durante el siglo XII”, *Los Cimientos del Estado en la Edad Media: Cancillerías, notariado y privilegios reales en la construcción del Estado en la Edad Media*, Juan Antonio Barrio, ed. Alcoy: Marfil, 2004: 65-91; Miranda García, Fermín. “La afirmación ideológica de la monarquía navarra y el empleo del romance en el entorno de 1200”. *e-Spania. Revue interdisciplinaire d'études médiévales et modernes*, 13 (2012): 1-14 [Electronic journal: <<http://e-spania.revues.org/21080>>; online since 06/2012].

76. Ramírez Vaquero, Eloísa. “Pensar el pasado, construir el futuro. Rodrigo Jiménez de Rada”, *1212-1214, el trienio que hizo Europa*. Pamplona: Gobierno de Navarra, 2011: 13-46. The study obviously exceeds the Navarre sector but is included for the great number of relevant references on the issues of this paper.

77. Pavón, Júlía. *Poblamiento altomedieval navarro. Base económica del espacio monárquico*. Pamplona: Eunsa, 2001. There had been some previous approaches on this topic in: Pavón, Júlía. “Poblamiento medieval en Navarra”. *Cuadernos de Arqueología de la Universidad de Navarra*, 3 (1995): 271-298, and Pavón, Júlía. “Aspectos de la organización social del territorio navarro altomedieval”. *Cuadernos de Arqueología de la Universidad de Navarra*, 5 (1997): 145-242, which is basically a summary of her thesis.



reflection, in addition to other initial approaches to certain topics which require further development in the future.

Juan José Larrea returned to a subject that he had already developed in his thesis, but now more briefly and limited to the 8th and 10th centuries⁷⁸. In addition, he has written studies on the western territories of the kingdom during the times immediately prior to the Castilian occupation by Alfonso VI in 1076, perfectly suited to the models which had been already developed in his principal study⁷⁹, highlighting the importance of the ecclesiastic deployment in territorial organisation, as well as that of the ‘feudal attack’ on power, as the main cause of the political collapse. Beyond the perspective of analysis, the system of “tenencias” (military responsibilities entrusted to certain nobles in specific castles) established by the monarchy in the combination of politic power and the territorial application thereof must be highlighted (although not necessarily controlled at all times nor absolutely by the monarchy). Aitor Pescador worked on the topic in relation to the western areas⁸⁰. Gipuzcoan territory, the inclusion of which in the Kingdom of Pamplona at time has been widely debated, has been briefly addressed, in light of the first documentary evidence of the name of the region by David Peterson, who proposes bringing forward the first mentions—and arguably a certain coinciding of territory—to the middle of the 10th century, while José Luis Orella prefers to highlight its organization as a “tenencia” at the end of the 12th century. Armando Besga also offers an overall balance⁸¹. There are other work on the Álava territorial structure related with two specific areas, Treviño and the Tierra de Ayala, which

78. Larrea, Juan José. “Territorio y sociedad en la Vasconia de los siglos VIII a X”, *Vasconia en la Alta Edad Media...*: 19-28. The volume, which was the result of a symposium held in 2009 and whose archaeological dossier and references to the Andalusian world have already been mentioned, is completed by the work of Juan Antonio Quirós (Quirós, Juan Antonio. “Los paisajes altomedievales en el País Vasco, 500-900: De la desarticulación territorial a la emergencia de los condados”, *Vasconia en la Alta Edad Media...*: 39-54), and the work of Igor Salazar (“La génesis del poblamiento altomedieval: Comparando Emilia oriental y Álava (siglos VI-X)”, *Vasconia en la Alta Edad Media...*: 71-86), in addition to general conclusions by Chris Wickham (Wickham, Chris. “Conclusiones”, *Vasconia en la Alta Edad Media...*: 87-90) and the results of the round table which closed the cycle (“Mesa redonda: Vasconia en la Alta Edad Media”, *Vasconia en la Alta Edad Media...*: 91-118).

79. Larrea, Juan José. “La herencia vasca: acción política y arquitectura social en Vizcaya y Álava antes de su incorporación al reino de Alfonso VI”, *Alfonso VI y su época. I. Los precedentes del reinado (966-1065)*, Etelvina Fernández, Javier Pérez, ed. León: Universidad de León, 2007: 69-119; similar to a micro-history essay on Momoitio hermitage, Larrea, Juan José. “Entre dos épocas y dos reinos (1000-1076)”. *Cuadernos de Alzate*, 31 (2004): 25-47.

80. Pescador, Aitor. “Tenentes y tenencias del Reino de Pamplona en Álava, Vizcaya, Guipúzcoa, La Rioja y Castilla (1004-1076)”. *Vasconia: Cuadernos de historia - geografía*, 29 (1999): 107-144. Some studies on private particular “tenentes” (nobles in charge of a “tenencia”) and “tenencias” must be highlighted, such as the work by Serafín Olcoz Yanguas for La Rioja area: Olcoz, Serafín. “El ‘buen padre’ Fortún Sánchez, la tenencia de Nájera y otras tenencias relevantes del reino de Pamplona durante la primera mitad del siglo XI”. *Príncipe de Viana*, 71 (2010): 121-184; or Olcoz, Serafín. “Fortún Ochoaz, las tenencias pamplonesas de Viguera, Cantabria, Meltria y el mítico origen del Señorío de los Cameros”. *Berceo*, 158 (2010): 97-158.

81. Peterson, David. “Primeras referencias a Guipúzcoa”. *Fontes Linguae Vasconum. Studia et documenta*, 36 (2004): 597-608; Orella, José Luis. “Nacimiento de Guipúzcoa como tenencia navarra de frontera”.



evidence the continuity of the territorial politics of the different kings, despite the alternating of power, which was Castilian as of 1200⁸².

The importance of roads as elements of territorial structure and development, in particular, the principal and so called Way of St. James, have also been analysed in important studies⁸³.

The process of the (*Re*)conquista and subsequent resettlement of the country is the subject of state of issue on the Navarre-Aragon area by Antonio Ubieto and Isabel Falcón, with data up to 1990, and of a brief balance about its relation with on feudalism development by Ramón Ferrer. There are almost no later studies in this respect worthy of mention⁸⁴.

The role of feudal power in territorial organisation should not be overlooked, although on many occasions hidden under the appearance of delegated royal power. However, such a function can often be seen through the symbolic vocabulary of the centres of power, as José Ángel García de Cortázar and Esther Peña Bocos have pointed out⁸⁵. This is also the case of the ecclesiastic network, although more obvious, which sometimes consolidates or even creates the population network

Lurralde. *Investigación y espacio*, 34 (2011): 189-217; Besga, Armando. "Guipúzcoa durante la Alta Edad Media". *Letras de Deusto*, 93 (2001): 9-38.

82. García, Francisco Javier. "En los confines de la 'Álava nuclear': una nueva visión del valle de Ayala en la Alta Edad Media a la luz de la documentación de San Millán de la Cogolla", *La tierra de Ayala: actas de las Jornadas de Estudios Históricos en conmemoración del 600 aniversario de la construcción de la Torre de Quejana*, Ernesto García, coord. Vitoria: Diputación Foral de Álava, 2001: 45-56; Martín, Iñaki. "De Ibida a Treviño: los procesos de jerarquización y la formación de la villa (siglos XII-XIII)", *Viaje a Íbita. Estudios históricos del condado de Treviño*, Roberto González, Ricardo Garay, coords. Treviño: Ayuntamiento de Treviño, 2012: 123-141.

83. Especialmente, Martín Duque, Ángel. "El Camino de Santiago y la articulación del espacio histórico navarro", *El Camino de Santiago y la articulación del espacio hispánico: XX Semana de Estudios Medievales en Estella*, 1993, Ángel Martín, ed. Pamplona: Gobierno de Navarra, 1993: 129-156. Also, Villalba, Francisco Javier. "Panorama de las vías de comunicación en Navarra durante la Edad Media (siglos VIII al XII). *Espacio, tiempo y forma. Serie III. Historia Medieval*, 8 (1995): 39-50; Villalba, Francisco Javier. "Las vías de comunicación en el reino de Pamplona a partir de la documentación del monasterio de Leire", *Medievo Hispano*. Madrid: SEEM, 1995: 391-411.

84. Ubieto, Antonio; Falcón, Isabel. "Reconquista y repoblación de los reinos de Aragón y de Navarra: estado de la cuestión de los últimos cuarenta años", *Actas del Coloquio de la V Asamblea General de la Sociedad Española de Estudios Medievales*. Zaragoza: Diputación General de Aragón, 1991: 55-72; Ferrer, Ramón. "Repoblación y feudalismo en el reino de Navarra", *En Torno al feudalismo hispánico: I Congreso de Estudios Medievales*. Ávila: Fundación Sánchez-Albornoz, 1991: 401-416. The conquest of Calahorra by García el de Nájera has been revised by Olcoz, Serafín. "Notas sobre la conquista de Calahorra (1045)". *Kalakorikos*, 14 (2009): 227-250. A brief comparative study on the initial Christian resettlement in the medium Aragon valley by: Miranda García, Fermín. "El poblamiento del valle medio del Aragón en los siglos IX-XII". *Príncipe de Viana*, 66 (2005): 393-403.

85. García, José Ángel; Peña, Esther. "El 'Palatium', símbolo y centro de poder, en los reinos de Navarra y Castilla en los siglos X a XII". *Mayurqa*, 22 (1989): 281-296.



itself⁸⁶; in fact, the Church maintained certain characteristics of the population network in certain regions under Andalusian control⁸⁷.

However, where the monarchy most symbolically demonstrates this function is through its laws, the legal codes, (“fueros”) which are used not only to activate (or attempt to activate) the territory, but also to flaunt territorial and personal power. It is worth recalling the synthesis by Luis Javier Fortún, but also other regional and local analyses which are useful in order to establish the context⁸⁸.

7. Social and economic transformations

As stated above, discussion on certain aspects of social transformation and, in particular—and I add now—the transformation of rural groups, is one of the main areas of disagreement in historiography with regard to these centuries. Therefore and in addition to the above statements, the field has been very active for many years, which in no way means that a consensus has been reached. From a certain perspective, Juan José Larrea constitutes a reference by contrasting different opinions, which relieves us from presenting claims that would largely exceed available space and are not the aim of this balance⁸⁹. In this one and other articles⁹⁰,

86. Jimeno, Roldán. “Hagionimia histórica, instituciones eclesíásticas locales y poblamiento alto medieval del valle de Izagaondoa (Navarra)”. *Príncipe de Viana*, 65 (2004): 777-787, and Jimeno, Roldán. “Iglesias propias y tenencias en la teofrontera sangüesina. Las cuencas del Onsella y el Aragón hasta 1076”. *Zangotzarra*, 11 (2007): 151-169; Larrea, Juan José. “Construir iglesias, construir territorio: las dos fases altomedievales de San Román de Tobillas (Álava)”. *Monasteria et territoria. Elites, edilicia y territorio en el Mediterráneo medieval (siglos V-XI)*. Actas del III Encuentro Internacional e Interdisciplinar sobre la alta Edad Media en la Península Ibérica, Jorge López, Artemio Manuel Martínez, Jorge Morín, coords. Madrid: Universidad Autónoma de Madrid, 2007: 321-336.

87. Larrea, Juan José. “Obispos efímeros, comunidades y homicidio en la Rioja Alta en los siglos X y XI”. *Brocar*, 31 (2007): 177-199.

88. Fortún, Luis Javier. “Fueros locales de Navarra”. *Jerónimo Zurita*, 78-79 (2004): 113-152; Elizari, Juan Francisco. “¿De la frontera a la franquicia? Una reflexión a propósito del fuero de Arguedas”, *Segundo Congreso General de Historia de Navarra...*: II, 347-351; Pavón, Júlía. “Fuero de Jaca y Fuero de Estella: observaciones críticas”, *XV Congreso de Historia de la Corona de Aragón, III: Jaca en la Corona de Aragón, siglos XII-XVIII*. Zaragoza: Gobierno de Aragón, 1996: 341-353; Arrechea, Horacio. “Algunas correspondencias entre el fuero de Estella y el fuero de Tudela”, *Segundo Congreso General de Historia de Navarra...*: II, 315-324; Miranda García, Fermín. “Fueros de franquicia y articulación del espacio pirenaico en Navarra (ca. 1150-1250)”, *Habitats et peuplement dans les Pyrénées au Moyen Âge et à l'époque moderne*, Jean-Pierre Barraqué, Philippe Sénac, coords. Toulouse: CNRS-Université Toulouse-Le Mirail, 2009: 65-76.

89. Larrea, Juan José. “La condición del campesinado navarro-aragonés entre los siglos IX y XII: una revisión crítica”. *En la España medieval*, 29 (2006): 383-409.

90. Apart from other studies mentioned in previous notes, Larrea, Juan José. “Aldeas navarras y aldeas del Duero. Notas para una perspectiva comparada”. *Edad Media. Revista de Historia*, 6 (2004): 159-181 is narrated from a perspective which is closer to the occupation of the territory. The work by Loring, María Isabel. “La expansión de la servidumbre en el Reino de Navarra a mediados del siglo XI: el ejemplo de Terrero”. *En la España Medieval*, 12 (1989): 45-69 may be considered of the same position, at least partially. This work in press, I learned about degree memory Arsenio Dacosta read in 1993 at the University of Salamanca, *Integración social y feudalización en la Navarra nuclear durante la Alta Edad Media*



he maintains his well-known theory on the almost exclusive predominance of peasant ingeniousness (liberty) until the ‘feudal revolution’ in the middle and final decades of the 11th century. Other authors, such as Ángel Martín Duque, already mentioned above, or Fermín Miranda, consider that servile dependency reached its peak long before, as a result of evolving phases of rapid and slow change⁹¹ and the status of liberty must be associated with the world of the lower nobility or, if applicable, the first “francos” (bourgeois)⁹². Carlos Laliena even defending the predominance of servitude as the social status of peasants for centuries, does not deny the existence of free peasant groups during the period; amongst other reason for royal intervention a progressive decline of rural servitude displays over them, especially as of the 13th century⁹³.

Logically, the debate reflects, in one way or another, the studies on the secular and ecclesiastic aristocracy, the nobility, aside with the king —himself being part of the group—, the owners of the dependent peasants, who are therefore also referred to in aforementioned studies, representing important and even principal references. The balance study by Ángel Martín Duque⁹⁴ or the interesting proposals by Carlos Laliena on the role of the aristocracy during the reign of Sancho the Great have been specific important contributions in this regard.

The first steps of urban renaissance in the Kingdom of Pamplona were traditionally linked to the support for the process received from the Aragonese dynasty since 1076. This point of view is still widely accepted and can be seen

(990-1090), largely relied on gentile models of transition to feudalism reinterpreted by J. M. Minguez. I thank the author facilitated a copy of the manuscript.

91. Martín Duque, Ángel. “Señores y siervos en el Pirineo occidental hispano hasta el siglo XI”, *Señores, siervos, vasallos en la Alta Edad Media: XXVIII Semana de Estudios Medievales. Estella: 2001*, José Ángel García and others, ed. Pamplona: Gobierno de Navarra, 2002: 363-412, as a comparative study of his opinions set forth in different studies; Miranda García, Fermín. “Notas para el estudio de la sociedad medieval navarra. Comunidad vecinal y comunidad familiar campesinas en el siglo XI”. *Notas y Estudios de Ciencias Sociales*, 3 (1990): 55-64; Miranda García, Fermín. “La heredad servil en tierras pamplonesas, siglo XI”, *Segundo Congreso General de Historia de Navarra...: II*, 429-437; Miranda García, Fermín. “Algunas notas sobre la familia campesina navarra en la Edad Media”. *Aragón en la Edad Media*, 14-15 (1999): 1047-1060.

92. See note 97 below.

93. Laliena, Carlos. “Documentos sobre la servidumbre en la sociedad navarro-aragonesa del siglo XI”. *Príncipe de Viana*, 58 (1997): 371-392; Laliena, Carlos. “La conversion des cens agraires dans le domaine royal en Navarre (1180-1234)”, *Calculs et rationalité dans la seigneurie médiévale: les conversions de redevances entre XI^e et XV^e siècles*. Laurent Feller, ed. Paris: Publications de la Sorbonne, 2009: 253-268; also, although it exceeds the time period of this study: Laliena, Carlos. “La servitude dans le nord de la péninsule Ibérique: modalités d’un déclin”. *Mélanges de l’Ecole française de Rome. Moyen Âge*, 112 (2000): 961-989. I have not been able to consult with the necessary attention the new and no doubt must book by the same author, appeared when this work was already in print, *siervos medievales de Aragón y Navarra en los siglos XI al XIII*. Zaragoza: prensas de la Universidad de Zaragoza, 2012.

94. Martín Duque, Ángel. “Nobleza navarra altomedieval”, *La nobleza peninsular en la Edad Media*. Ávila: Fundación Sánchez-Albornoz, 1999: 227-254; Laliena, Carlos. “Una revolución silenciosa Transformaciones de la aristocracia navarro-aragonesa bajo Sancho el Mayor”. *Aragón en la Edad Media*, 10-11 (1996): 481-502.



in the balance on the topic by Juan Carrasco⁹⁵, as well as in many studies by Ángel Martín Duque, some of which already quoted in previous sections. This last author had already pointed out the necessary and even immediately prior presence of emigrant groups that created the adequate basis for the process to correctly develop, more specifically with reference to the Estella Legal Code (the “fuero”) in approximately 1080⁹⁶. Fermín Miranda nevertheless maintain that this previous presence can be identified in distant time periods, since the middle of the 11th century, relating to certain terms and migration movements, which hardly fit into the social context of the time⁹⁷. This assumption would also lead to the refuting of the traditional historiographic idea that the first inhabitants of the towns in the Kingdom of Pamplona came from continental areas, with no exceptions and particularly from the French Midi. The anthroponomical analysis and power relations established from the beginning seem to refute this old assumption⁹⁸. The important role exclusively assigned to the Monarchy as the main agent for bourgeois development may be questioned, at least regarding the capital of the kingdom, whose seigneurial domain, ecclesiastic or royal represents at the same time one of the main elements of historiographic debate⁹⁹, although it does not allow debate on other cases¹⁰⁰, including some important regions

95. Carrasco, Juan. “Los inicios de la vida urbana en el Reino de Pamplona bajo la Unión Dinástica con Aragón (1076-1134)”, *Actas de la reunión científica “El Fuero de Logroño y su época. Logroño 1995”*, Francisco Javier García, Isabel Martínez, eds. Logroño: Ayuntamiento de Logroño, 1996: 145-166. In a broader time context but limited to the St. James Route, Carrasco, Juan. “El camino francés a Compostela y la dinámica de los asentamientos”, *Itinerari medievali e identità europea*, Roberto Greci, ed. Bolonia: Clueb, 1999: 147-180.

96. Martín Duque, Ángel. “La fundación del primer ‘burgo’ navarro. Estella”. *Príncipe de Viana*, 51 (1990): 317-327.

97. Miranda García, Fermín. “Algunas propuestas sobre transformaciones sociales y renacimiento urbano en el reino de Pamplona (ca. 1050-1080)”, *García Sánchez III “el de Nájera”...: 173-190*; Miranda García, Fermín. “Migraciones y poblamiento en el Pirineo central y occidental (ca. 850-1050)”, *Movimientos migratorios, asentamientos y expansión (siglos VIII-XI). XXXIV Semana de Estudios Medievales. Estella 2007*, José María Lacarra, Angel Sesma *et alii*, eds. Pamplona: Gobierno de Navarra, 2008: 155-177.

98. Ramírez Vaquero, Eloísa. “The first urban oligarchic networks in Navarre: Pamplona, 1100-1328”, *Oligarchy and Patronage in Late Medieval Spanish Urban Society*, María Asenjo, coord. Turnhout: Brepols, 2009: 117-152.

99. Miranda García, Fermín. “Pamplona, ciudad y señorío episcopal. Apuntes para un debate historiográfico”, *Iglesia y ciudad. Espacio y poder (siglos VIII-XIII)*, Gregoria Caverro, coord. León: Universidad de Oviedo-Universidad de León, 2011: 217-243, which presents a comparative study of the debate and defends the existence of a full episcopal domain. Different opinion of Martín Duque, Ángel. “El señorío episcopal de Pamplona hasta 1276”, *La catedral de Pamplona*, María Antonia del Burgo, ed. Pamplona: Caja de Ahorros de Navarra, 1993: I, 72-80; II, 222-225, which defends the existence of a shared power between the king and the bishop.

100. García, Ernesto; López, Félix; Díaz de Durana, José Ramón. *La bastida en la Edad Media: poblamiento y organización político-administrativa (s. X-XIII)*. Álava: Diputación Foral, 1990. See also: Vaquero, Manuel. “El patrimonio de Santa María de Irache en Estella hasta 1222. Una fuente para el estudio del desarrollo urbano navarro altomedieval”. *En la España medieval*, 12 (1989): 95-105; or Monteano, Pello. “Los orígenes de Villava”. *Príncipe de Viana*, 56 (1995): 319-342.



prior to the Christian conquest, such as the very Nájera, which was the royal seat until 1076¹⁰¹.

Jewish communities are linked to the urban development and were well-known since the end of the 11th century, as studied by Juan Carrasco¹⁰². On the other hand, the Mudejar minority, which remained in the Ribera areas (southern part of Navarre) after the conquest, although also in towns, presents its best example of social and economic dependency through the rural Moorish tenants (*exáricos*)¹⁰³.

8. Church and religion

There is no need to recall all the details of some of the views regarding the importance of the debate, amongst other issues, on the presence of the bishops of Pamplona in the Hispano-Gothic Council Assemblies, or on the seigniorial domain of Pamplona in the early Middle Ages. Such issues largely exceed this specific section, although the same could be said of any related issue.

The same occurs with studies on ecclesiastic property, which very often result from theses whose chronological context exceeds the early and high Middle Ages, but is mainly focused on it. The best examples are the monasteries of Santa María de Irache and San Salvador de Leire, since they represent extremely important centres of institutional and socio-economic power during the time, particularly in the second case¹⁰⁴. Apart from all the above, there are also specific approaches or studies of a more limited context on the same monasteries or others, such as San Millán de la Cogolla, San Martín de Albelda and San Prudencio de Montelaturce, all of them in La Rioja¹⁰⁵.

101. Cantera, Margarita. "La ciudad de Nájera en tiempos del rey García", *García Sánchez III el de Nájera...*: 39-72.

102. As most of his works, this study covers a larger time period than the one analysed in this article, but the following comparative study is worth mentioning with regard to this period, Carrasco, Juan. "Las primeras migraciones judías en el reino de Navarra (1076-1328)", *Movimientos migratorios y expulsiones en la diáspora occidental. Terceros encuentros judaicos de Tudela*. 1998, Fermín Miranda, coord. Pamplona: Universidad Pública de Navarra-Gobierno de Navarra, 1999: 9-38.

103. Hernández, María del Carmen. "Algunas aportaciones sobre la situación social de los exaricos en la zona sur de Navarra", *Actas X Simposio Internacional de Mudejarismo, Teruel 2005*. Teruel: Centro de Estudios Mudéjares, 2007: 487-500, which contains, above all, some documents particularly significant for this issue.

104. García, Ernesto. *Santa María de Irache: expansión y crisis de un señorío monástico navarro en la Edad Media (958-1537)*. Bilbao: UPV, 1989; Fortún, Luis Javier. *Leire, un señorío monástico en Navarra, siglos IX-XIX*. Pamplona: Gobierno de Navarra, 1993.

105. Luís Javier Fortún made an approach on the first stages of the monastery of San Salvador de Leire in Fortún, Luís Javier. "Ascenso, apogeo y crisis de un monasterio benedictino: San Salvador de Leire (siglos XI-XII)", *Los grandes monasterios benedictinos hispanos de época románica (1050-1200)*, José Ángel García de Cortázar, Ramón Teja, coords. Aguilar de Campoo: Fundación Santa María la Real, 2007: 9-58. On the occasion of a series of conferences, which were later published, José Ángel García de Cortázar analysed once more the prominence of San Millán de la Cogolla, the subject of his renewing thesis:



The studies on the episcopate of the kingdom are not limited to those mentioned above. The period prior to the beginning of the Gregorian Reform, which was also witness to extremely intense ecclesiastic structure renovation, has been analysed by Luis Javier Fortún¹⁰⁶.

There is also a specific analysis of the peculiar case of the Infanta Sancha, the sister of Sancho Ramírez and the administrator of the income from the vacant Pamplona Episcopal properties for a short period of time, in one of the very few studies of early medieval Navarre which claims to be part of the so-called 'gendered history'¹⁰⁷. The vacancy was filled by reformist Pierre d'Andouque, whose eventful life and death are subject to an individual study¹⁰⁸.

With regard to the different aspects of religion, initial mention should be made to a study on the evolution of the worship of saints in the Navarre central regions which, as in previous cases, largely exceeds the chronological framework of this paper, but it's particularly interesting¹⁰⁹. The view of the importance of nobility devotion in order to support the Temple during its initial appearance in the Navarre-Aragon area by José Ángel Lema is also interesting¹¹⁰. In addition, a new approach to the image of Navarre in the key medieval pilgrimage guide, *Liber Sancti Iacobi*, must also be included¹¹¹.

García, José Ángel. "El dominio del monasterio de San Millán de la Cogolla en los siglos X y XII", *San Millán de la Cogolla en la Edad Media*, Juan Cordero, ed. Logroño: Ateneo, 1999: 13-26. Francisco Javier García reviews the origins of the monastery from a multidisciplinary perspective in García, Francisco Javier. "El monasterio de San Millán de la Cogolla en la Alta Edad Media. Aproximación histórica". *Berceo*, 133 (1997): 9-25. He also published some brief notes on the Albelda monastery: García, Francisco Javier. "El monasterio de San Martín de Albelda. Aproximación histórica", *Códice Albeldense 976, original conservado en la Biblioteca del real Monasterio de San Lorenzo del Escorial (d.I.2)*, Torrejón de Ardoz-Madrid: Testimonio-Patrimonio Nacional, 2002: 9-27; and on the Montelaturce monastery, García, Francisco Javier. "El monasterio de San Prudencio de Monte Laturce (siglos X-XII)". *Espacio, tiempo y forma. Serie III, Historia medieval*, 2 (1989): 137-160.

106. Fortún, Luis Javier. "Monjes y obispos en el reinado de García Sánchez III el de Nájera", *García Sánchez III "el de Nájera"...*: 191-252.

107. Muñoz, Itziar. "Notas sobre la religiosidad de la mujer navarra: la condesa Sancha, teniente del obispado de Pamplona", *Las mujeres en el cristianismo medieval. Imágenes teóricas y cauces de actuación religiosa*, Ángel Muñoz, coord. Madrid: al-Mudayna, 1989: 373-384.

108. Soria, Myriam. "'Tolosae moritur, Pampilonae sepelitur'. Pierre d'Andouque, un évêque malmené", *La imagen del obispo hispano en la Edad Media*, Martín Aurell, María Ángeles Rodríguez, coords. Pamplona: Eunsa, 2004: 167-184.

109. Jimeno, Roldán. *El culto a los santos en la Cuenca de Pamplona (siglos V al XVI). Estratigrafía hagiográfica de los espacios sagrados urbanos y rurales*. Pamplona: Gobierno de Navarra, 2003. This author has also made some partial studies on the same issue, such as "Instituciones religiosas y culto a los santos en Sangüesa y su periferia durante los siglos medievales". *Zangotzarra*, 8 (2004): 87-124.

110. Lema, José Ángel. "Las cofradías y la introducción del Temple en los reinos de Aragón y Pamplona: Guerra, intereses y piedad religiosa". *Anuario de Estudios Medievales*, 28 (1998): 311-328.

111. Anguita, José María. "Navarra y el 'Liber Sancti Iacobi'". *Príncipe de Viana*, 60 (1999): 209-234.



9. The world of culture

As already pointed out on several occasions, even in specific studies, the early medieval Navarre area, as many others, is a melting pot of cultures with elements of varying intensity, apart from the singular Vasconia culture¹¹².

Obviously, a review of the different forms of art should be carried out in this section, given that iconography books and Romanic (even pre-Romanic, if the debated term is accepted) architecture and sculpture reached their climax during the time period studied. However, the impossibility of doing so was already mentioned at the beginning of this balance study, both for reasons based on its specific methodology (for which the undersigned is not qualified) and the large number and quality of the relevant studies.

Accordingly, within such a complex context, historiographic analysis is mainly focused on two aspects, which have very often been studied from different perspectives at the same time.

With regard to the Christian intellectual groups, it must be pointed out that the Latin monastery culture of around 1000, especially in the area of La Rioja, has been extremely important for historiography, as indicated by collective studies on the *Albeldense Codex*¹¹³ and on the world of Sancho the Great¹¹⁴, or by individual studies along the same lines¹¹⁵. In addition, the importance of other centres must also be acknowledged, such as the monastery of San Salvador de Leire, considered by Fernando González Ollé as the nucleus in the birth of the Navarre Romance language¹¹⁶. Along the same lines is the relevance of secular culture which, as of the 12th century, is mainly dealt with by certain important studies, such as the *Poem of Roland*, ultimately inspired by the Battle of Roncesvalles¹¹⁷, although it also provides

112. Jimeno, Roldán. "Sustrato cultural de la Vasconia altomedieval". *Revista Internacional de los Estudios Vascos*, 44, (1999): 441-454.

113. *Códice Albeldense 976, original conservado en la Biblioteca del real Monasterio...*

114. Bango, Isidro, coord. *Sancho el Mayor y sus herederos. El linaje que europeizó los reinos hispanos*. Pamplona: Gobierno de Navarra, 2006, 2 vols; it is the Catalogue of the exhibition with the same name which was held on the thousandth anniversary of the king.

115. García, Javier. "Contribución del monasterio de San Millán de la Cogolla a la cultura medieval", *Cultura de élites y cultura popular en occidente: Edades Media y Moderna*, Ernesto García, ed. Vitoria: Universidad del País Vasco, 2001: 37-56; Díaz, Manuel C. "Tradiciones culturales librerías en el reino de Pamplona", *Ante el milenario del reinado de Sancho el Mayor...*: 197-212; Gilarrondo, Óscar. "Relaciones culturales Navarra-Francia Relaciones culturales entre Navarra y el sur de Francia en el siglo XI: las fábulas del manuscrito Madrid RAH 39". *Príncipe de Viana*, 69 (2008): 239-260.

116. González Ollé, Fernando. "Leire y el romance. La función de Leire en la génesis y difusión del romance navarro, con noticia lingüística de su documentación". *Príncipe de Viana*, 58 (1997): 653-707.

117. The researchers' work with regard to the *Poem of Roland* and, in general, to its tradition, also exceeds the possibilities of this work. Some works specifically relating to the battle episode or Navarre are given as examples, such as González, Vicente J. "La auténtica batalla de Roncesvalles y la existencia real de Bernardo del Carpio", *Aspects de l'épopée romane: Mentalités-idéologies-intertextualités*, Hans van Dijk, Willem Noomen, coords. Groningen: Forsten, 1995: 241-250; Crosas, Francisco. "Ferragut en el Camino de Santiago (con especial atención a Navarra)". *Príncipe de Viana*, 59 (1998): 875-879; Martín Duque, Ángel. "Roncesvalles y las huellas carolingias Roncesvalles y las huellas carolingias vistos por los peregrinos", *El Pseudo-Turpín, lazo entre el culto jacobeo y el culto de Carlomagno: Actas del VI Congreso Internacional de Estudios*



in-depth analyses of certain works written in Romance, although of a foreign origin, but in some way relating to Navarre¹¹⁸.

The Jewish minority of the kingdom, especially that of Tudela, experienced its cultural golden age around 1100 (the Christian conquest took place in 1119), and therefore it is not surprising that it is still valid in the studies of this period, although nowadays the main characters are quite peculiar, such as the traveller Benjamín de Tudela¹¹⁹, the mystic and apologetic poet Yehuda ha-Levi¹²⁰ and, above all, the philosopher and poet Abraham ibn Ezra, one of the greatest renewers of the thinking of his time. There have been congresses completely devoted to the author¹²¹, as well as contextual studies¹²² or critical editions and comments on different aspects of his encyclopaedic work¹²³.

Jacobeos, Klaus Herbers, ed. Santiago de Compostela: Xerencia de Promoción do Camiño de Santiago, 2003: 83-95; Uriarte, Lía Noemí. "La emboscada de Roncesvalles". *Letras. Revista de la Facultad de Filosofía y Letras de la Pontificia Universidad Católica Santa María de los Buenos Aires*, 52-53 (2006): 308-315; López, Santiago. "'De bello Runcievallis'". La composition de la bataille de Roncevaux dans la chronique de Turpin". *Romania: Revue trimestrielle consacrée à l'étude des langues et des littératures romanes*, 126 (2008): 65-102.

118. Ruiz, Juan Antonio. "'Bellatores' navarros en el Poema de Fernán González", *Segundo Congreso General de Historia de Navarra...*: 477-485.

119. de Tudela, Benjamín. *Libro de Viajes*, Xabier Kintana, José Ramón Magdalena, trans. Pamplona: Gobierno de Navarra, 1994.

120. Yehuda, ha-Levi. *Lírica religiosa y cantos de Sión*. Bilbao: Ega, 1993; Yehuda, ha-Levi. *Nueva antología poética*, Rafael Castillo, trans. Madrid: Hiperon, 1997; Yehuda, ha-Levi. *El cuzary: libro de la prueba y de la demostración en defensa de la religión menospreciada*. Barcelona: Ediciones Índigo, 2001; Yehuda, ha-Levi. *Haizearen hegaletan [Sobre las alas del viento: antología poética]*, Xabier Kintana, trans. Bilbao: Euskaltzaindia, 2002. Yehuda, ha-Levi; Ibn Ezra, Abraham. *Poesía hispanohebrea tudelana*. Pamplona: Ediciones y libros, 2003; McDonald, Christopher J. "Judah ha Levi's *kuzari*: Proto-Zionism, the Padox of Post-colonial Prosody, and the Ridiculous Rabbi". *Bulletin of Hispanic Studies*, 73/3 (1996): 339-351.

121. Díaz, Fernando, ed. *Abraham Ibn Ezra y su tiempo: actas del Simposio Internacional: Madrid, Tudela, Toledo, 1989*. Madrid: Universidad Autónoma de Madrid-Asociación Española de Orientalistas, 1990.

122. Cantera, Enrique. "Abraham ibn Ezra en las crónicas hispanohebreas". *Kalakorikos*, 9 (2004): 241-256.

123. Completeness in this respect is impossible. Amongst other examples, see Cano, María José. "Sobre el poema histórico de Abraham ibn 'Ezra', titulado Ahad Yarad", *Homenaje al Prof. Jacinto Bosch Vilá*. Granada, Universidad, 1991: II, 679-688; Ibn Ezra, Abraham. *Sefer Moznayim*. Córdoba: El Almendro, 2002; Sela, Shlomo. "Contactos científicos entre judíos y cristianos en el siglo XII: El caso del Libro de las Tablas Astronómicas de Abraham Ibn Ezra en su versión latina y hebrea". *Miscelánea de estudios árabes y hebraicos. Sección de hebreo*, 45 (1996): 185-222; Sela, Shlomo. "Algunos puntos de contacto entre el 'Libro de Tablas Astronómicas' en su versión latina y las obras literarias hebreas de Abraham ibn Ezra". *Miscelánea de estudios árabes y hebraicos. Sección de hebreo*, 46 (1997): 37-56; Sela, Shlomo. "La creación del mundo supralunar según Abraham ibn Ezra: un estudio comparativo de sus dos comentarios a Génesis 1:14". *Sefarad: Revista de Estudios Hebraicos y Sefardíes*, 63, (2003): 147-181; Cecilia, Alba; Sainz, Amparo; Sela, Shlomo. "La obra astrológica de Abraham Ibn Ezra en dos códices castellanos". *Sefarad: Revista de Estudios Hebraicos y Sefardíes*, 70 (2010): 375-398; Rodríguez Josefina. "El profeta Oseas y la astrología en el comentario bíblico de Abraham ibn Ezra". *Miscelánea de estudios árabes y hebraicos. Sección de hebreo*, 52 (2003): 243-261; Rodríguez Josefina. "Ptolomeo y la teoría lunar del judío Abraham Ibn Ezra", *Actas del XI Congreso Español de Estudios Clásicos*, Antonio Alvar, José Francisco González, eds. Madrid: Sección Española de Estudios Clásicos, 2005: III, 269-276; Itzhaki, Masha. "Tokhe hat ha-hayyim d'Abraham Ibn Ezra". *Hommage à Haïm Vidal*, Winfried Busse, ed. Madrid: Peter Lang, 1996: 125-138; Gómez, Mariano. *El comentario de Abraham Ibn Ezra al libro del Eclesiastés*. Madrid: CSIC, 1994; Gómez, Mariano;



10. Conclusion

According to the review above, historiography on early medieval Navarre develops, to a certain extent, in the same thematic and methodological fields as the rest of the Peninsular and European historiography, although it is difficult to find interesting examples in some areas. Nevertheless, it is worth highlighting that political history, which has been traditionally important, although from renewing perspectives, is still valid, while studies on social and economic aspects seem to be limited to topics related to urban origins, after a period of interesting debate. Studies on religious life only on very few occasions exceed the institutional framework of popular religiousness; and culture, even of the elite, needs to overcome in many cases—and with important exceptions—the limitations of description, to further analyse external influences, ideological contrasts or social scope. Reference to normal, or even saturated aspects with regard to certain topics are also difficult to find, such as private life, popular culture, the importance of femininity or sexuality, environment, etc. The lack of sources of information makes it undoubtedly difficult to initiate many of these subjects and we must therefore wait for the experts to identify the correct direction, through patience and wisdom.

ben Meïr Ibn Ezra, Abraham, ed. *El comentario de Abraham Ibn Ezra al Libro de Job*. Madrid: CSIC, 2004; Gómez, Mariano; ben Meïr Ibn Ezra, Abraham, ed. *Dos comentarios de Abraham Ibn Ezra al Libro de Ester*. Madrid: CSIC, 2007; Gómez, Mariano. “La influencia de Saadiá Gaón en el comentario de Abraham ibn Ezrá al libro de Job”. *Sefarad: Revista de Estudios Hebraicos y Sefardíes*, 67 (2007): 51-69; de Azcárraga, María Josefa. *El comentario de Abraham Ibn Ezra al libro de Rut*. Madrid: CSIC, 2008; Niclós, José Vicente. “Comentario al profeta Jonás de Abraham Ibn Ezra y la liturgia del perdón: Introducción, traducción, notas y texto hebreo”. *Estudios bíblicos*, 57 (1999): 483-515; Rodríguez, Josefina. “Los nombres de Dios: gramática, matemática y teología en Abraham ibn “Ezra”, *Maimónides y su época*, Carlos del Valle, Santiago García, Juan Pedro Monferrer, coords. Madrid: Sociedad Estatal de Conmemoraciones Culturales, 2007: 491-510; Ortega, María Teresa. “Observaciones gramaticales en el comentario de Abraham Ibn Ezra a Lamentaciones”. *Sefarad. Revista de Estudios Hebraicos y Sefardíes*, 63 (2003): 371-391.

